

Staff Report



To	City Council
Service Area	Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
Date	Monday, July 12, 2021
Subject	17 Mary Street: Heritage Permit for New Detached Garage (HP21-0007)

Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Permit Application (HP21-0007) for construction of a rear yard detached garage at property municipally known as 17 Mary Street be approved.
-

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

This report provides the staff recommendation to approve a heritage permit application for the construction of a rear yard detached garage at 17 Mary Street which is located within the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District.

Key Findings

The proposed construction is subject to the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines.

The heritage permit was deemed to be a major permit application that requires review by the Heritage Guelph committee and approval by City Council. Heritage Guelph reviewed the application at their meeting of June 14, 2021 and provided support.

The proposed design of the rear yard detached garage satisfies the plan and guidelines for the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District and staff recommend approval.

Financial Implications

The accessory building once completed will be assessed by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation and appropriately taxed by the City.

Report

The subject property is located on the west side of Mary Street south of Water Street (attachment 1) within the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District, as such, it is designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act through By-law (2014)-19812.

According to Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act, any proposed new construction, alteration, demolition or removal that would affect the heritage character of the property or the district is required to obtain approval through the heritage permit process. The construction of a new building on the subject property requires a heritage permit application (as per Section 4.4 of the HCD Plan and Guidelines) and Council Approval.

A new house was constructed on the property in 2019 through the approval of heritage permit HP19-0021. The owner has applied for heritage permit HP21-0007 to allow the construction of a detached, two-car garage in the northwest corner of the rear yard of the property. Current photos of the subject property and the proposed detached garage building design are shown in attachments 2 and 3.

Any new construction that is proposed within the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District is expected to comply with the HCD Plan and Guidelines and is required under applicable law to obtain Council's approval of a heritage permit before building permit(s) can be issued. The heritage permit will also address whether the building proposal would have any impact on adjacent protected heritage properties and demonstrate that the heritage attributes of the protected heritage property will be conserved.

The visual relationships between an infill building, its neighbours and the streetscape should be reviewed carefully and used as the basis for new construction. The size and placement of this simple, side gable roof garage form would not be easily seen from Mary Street and is compatible with the 2-storey, stone-clad house on the property. The garage exterior is to be clad in the same dark grey Maibec siding used on the house. The house was designed with an attached two-car garage that is stepped back from the front façade the equivalent width of the garage. Access to the rear yard would be provided through the right-side door of the attached garage through a new door proposed for the back wall of the existing garage.

The proposed detached garage would be visible from the rear yard of the McCrae House property, a National Historic Site that is within the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD and also protected by an individual designation by-law. The McCrae House rear yard perimeter has a variety of trees that already serve as partial screen of the adjacent properties. The existing 1.5 metre high solid wood fence and existing trees that are to be retained, at the back of 17 Mary Street would block most of the view of the garage from the McCrae House rear yard. The proponent has also proposed to plant tall shrubs along the outside of the north perimeter fence to further screen the north gable wall of the proposed garage. Guelph Museum staff were consulted and indicated that they were supportive of the existing and proposed additional screening of the garage.

Staff is of the opinion that heritage permit HP21-0007 for the construction of the proposed detached garage in the rear yard of 17 Mary Street is in keeping with proper heritage conservation practice and satisfies the following guidelines from the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD Plan:

4.1 Guidelines for Additions to Heritage Buildings

viii) New design of alterations may be permitted where they:

- do not harm, damage or remove valued heritage property, features and other distinguishing historical, architectural, streetscape or cultural features, and
- are of size, location and material that is compatible with the character of the property, building, landscape or streetscape
- are compatible with, distinguishable from, and subordinate to the original.

ix) Construction comprising new freestanding building masses within the heritage conservation district should fit with the prevailing character of adjacent properties, landscaping and existing grades and be compatible in design, size, location, height, setback, orientation to the street, materials, roof type, and fenestration; and

4.2.2 Garages and ancillary structures: Garages, carports and ancillary structures are best located away from the main façades of buildings and should be located in traditional areas for these functions, usually towards the rear of the lot and accessed by a driveway.

Staff is of the opinion that the design as presented satisfies the requirements of the heritage district designation plan and guidelines. Staff are also of the opinion that the heritage attributes of the protected heritage property (McCrae House at 108 Water Street) will be conserved. Heritage permit application HP21-0007 is recommended for approval under section 34 of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Financial Implications

The detached garage building once completed will be assessed by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation and appropriately taxed by the City.

Consultations

Heritage Guelph reviewed the application at their meeting of June 14, 2021 and passed the following motion:

1. THAT Heritage Guelph supports the property owner's proposal to construct a detached garage in the rear yard of 17 Mary Street, as proposed in the site plan and perspective drawings of the heritage permit application HP21-0007 presented at the June 14, 2021 meeting of Heritage Guelph; and
2. That any modifications necessary to complete the design that are minor in nature may be dealt with by the Senior Heritage Planner.

Strategic Plan Alignment

Priority

Building our future

Direction

Continue to build strong, vibrant, safe and healthy communities that foster resilience in the people who live here

Alignment

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is aligned with building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities

Attachments

Attachment-1 Location of Subject Property

Attachment-2 Current Photos of Property

Attachment-3 Design of Proposed Detached Garage Building

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate, MCIP, RPP, Manager, Policy Planning and Urban Design

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, Senior Heritage Planner

This report was approved by:

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP

General Manager, Planning and Building Services

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-837-5615, extension 2395

krista.walkey@guelph.ca

This report was recommended by:

Jayne Holmes, P.Eng., PMP

Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-822-1260 extension 2248

jayne.holmes@guelph.ca