

Staff Report



To	City Council
Service Area	Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
Date	Monday, July 12, 2021
Subject	60 Albert Street Heritage Permit for New Construction (HP21-0004)

Recommendation

1. That the Heritage Permit Application (HP21-0004) to construct a single detached dwelling at 60 Albert Street be approved.
-

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

This report provides a staff recommendation to approve a heritage permit application to construct a single detached dwelling at 60 Albert Street located within the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District.

Key Findings

The proposed construction is subject to the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines

The heritage permit was deemed to be a major heritage permit application that requires review by the Heritage Guelph committee and approval by City Council.

A complete application was received on April 20, 2021. The original proposed design did not receive staff support. Heritage permit application HP21-0004 was added to the May 10, 2021 Heritage Guelph meeting agenda at the proponent's request, however the application was subsequently withdrawn by the applicant in order to revise the design of the new dwelling.

A revised complete application was received on June 8, 2021 and considered by Heritage Guelph at their meeting of June 14, 2021. Heritage Guelph's review and recommendation influenced the proposed design recommended by staff in this report.

The proposed design of the single detached dwelling at 60 Albert Street satisfies the plan and guidelines for the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District and addresses Heritage Guelph's comments. Staff recommend approval.

Financial Implications

The new dwelling, once completed, will be assessed by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation and appropriately taxed by the City.

Report

The subject property is located on the southeast side of Albert Street (Attachments 1 and 2) within the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District and is designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act through By-law (2014)-19812.

60 Albert Street became a protected heritage property with the approval of the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District in 2015. Any new construction proposed is expected to comply with the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines and is required under applicable law to obtain Council's approval of a heritage permit before building permit(s) can be issued.

The subject property was previously part of 58 Albert Street. 60 Albert Street was created by the Committee of Adjustment's approval of severance application B27/12 in 2012. The dimensions of this lot were approved as 12.15 metres (39.86 feet) in width and a depth of 40.2 metres (131.88 feet). The subject property is shown in a plan of survey in Attachment 1.

The narrow lot width is similar to 68 Albert Street and those lots seen on the north side of the street at 61, 63, 67 and 69 Albert Street. These lots were all created by severances of the original lot fabric of Thompson's survey and well before the approval of the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District. All of the lots mentioned have parking areas beside the dwellings and not in front.

The conditions of the severance approval for 60 Albert Street included the following requirements:

(16.) That the elevation and design drawings for the new dwelling on the severed parcel be submitted to, and approved by the General Manager of Planning Services, prior to the issuance of a building permit for the new dwelling in order for staff to ensure that the design of the new dwelling respects the character of the surrounding neighbourhood in all respects and including the proposed massing, building setbacks and the size and location of any proposed garage.

(21.) That prior to the issuance of a building permit for the new dwelling, Heritage Planning staff and Heritage Guelph review and comment on all plans, including elevations, plans and site plan.

Revisions of Design

Attachment 3 shows the evolution of the proposed front elevation from the original to the final design now recommended by staff. Pre-consultation with Heritage Planning staff resulted in a complete application but without City staff's support for the original proposed design. Heritage permit application HP21-0004 was added to the [May 10, 2021 Heritage Guelph meeting agenda](#) at the proponent's request. The application and the May 10 agenda item was subsequently withdrawn by the applicant in order to revise the design for the new dwelling.

A revised complete application was received on June 8, 2021 and reviewed by staff. Staff's recommendations were placed on the [June 14 meeting agenda for Heritage Guelph](#). Council has 90 days from receipt to consider a complete application; failing that, the application is deemed to be approved.

At their meeting of June 14, 2021, Heritage Guelph reviewed Revision 1 (shown in Attachment 3). Heritage Guelph was not prepared to offer support for the proposed design and passed the following motion:

THAT Heritage Guelph recommends the proponent consider the following concerns in a re-design,

- the massing of the overall building
- the landscaping to be in keeping with the Conservation District Plan
- the return of the stone cladding around the side of the building
- roof form to be more in keeping with the district than a Mansard Roof
- the materials used should not include EIFS
- emphasizing pedestrian access
- consider letters of support from adjacent properties

Staff reviewed Heritage Guelph's comments with the applicant and worked with the applicant to address the massing, cladding, roof form, materials and access through revisions to the design. With respect to landscaping, according to section 5.2 of the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD Plan and Guidelines soft and hard landscaping (with the exception of trees of a size that contribute to the street canopy and new locations for driveways or paths) do not require approval of a heritage permit. Exterior Insulation and Finish Systems (EIFS) are strongly discouraged in the HCD Plan and guidelines and the applicant has not proposed use of this modern material. There is no requirement within the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD Plan and Guidelines for heritage permit applicants to consult adjacent property owners but during pre-consultation discussion staff recommend that proponents reach out to their neighbours. The applicant advised staff that they will reach out to adjacent property owners.

Review of the Revised Design

Based on review of the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines and the conditions of approval for the consent application that created the subject lot, Planning staff offer the following comments regarding the proposed new dwelling design for 60 Albert Street.

The proposed massing and height of the dwelling is compatible with the adjacent properties. The mansard roof shape employed in the proposed design is similar to that of the late 19th century, 2-storey dwelling located at the 31 Martin Avenue (Attachment-2). Heritage Guelph's concerns about a flat roof form have been addressed.

The setback of the proposed building façade and the protrusion of the steps to the front door are compatible with the adjacent properties. The applicant lowered the access to the dwelling to decrease the number of steps required.

As the majority of residential properties in the district are constructed with traditional materials such as brick or stone the applicant has chosen limestone veneer as the exterior wall material. To address Heritage Guelph's comments, the design includes stone cladding on the front and side walls.

The garage does not form part of the front façade of the main building and has been stepped back from the front façade the equivalent width of the garage. Section 4.6.7 of the HCD Plan and Guidelines states that parking areas should be located behind or set back from the building front, to allow for openness of the lot

rather than taking up traditional front yard space with parking areas. The applicant revised the design to incorporate a single car garage width and further stepped the garage back from the front wall of the building.

The large, mature street tree on City property in front of 60 Albert Street has been declared a hazard tree by a City Arborist and will be replaced.

Building Services staff have stated that the proposed design described in this heritage permit application is in conformance with the Zoning Bylaw.

Planning staff are of the opinion that heritage permit application HP21-0004 for the construction of a detached, single-family dwelling at 60 Albert Street is in keeping with proper heritage conservation practice and satisfies the requirements of the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines. The design as presented satisfies the requirements of the heritage district designation plan and guidelines. Heritage permit application HP21-0004 is recommended for approval under section 42 of Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Financial Implications

The building once completed will be assessed by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation and appropriately taxed by the City.

Consultations

Heritage Guelph reviewed proposed design Revision 1 (see Attachment 3) at their meeting of June 14, 2021 and provided commentary that has influenced the proposed design dated June 23, 2021, which is recommended by City staff in this report.

Strategic Plan Alignment

Priority

Building our Future

Direction

Continue to build strong, vibrant, safe and healthy communities that foster resilience in the people who live here

Alignment

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is aligned with building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities

Attachments

Attachment-1 Location of 60 Albert St and Plan of Survey

Attachment-2 Current Photos of 60 Albert St and Related Properties

Attachment-3 Evolution of Proposed Front Elevation Design

Attachment-4 Proposed Site Plan, Elevations and Perspective Views

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate, MCIP, RPP, Manager, Policy Planning and Urban Design

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, Senior Heritage Planner

This report was approved by:

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP

General Manager, Planning and Building Services

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-837-5615, extension 2395

krista.walkey@guelph.ca

This report was recommended by:

Jayne Holmes, P.Eng., PMP

Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-822-1260, extension 2248

jayne.holmes@guelph.ca