

Attachment-9 Planning Analysis

Provincial Policy Statement, 2020

The Provincial Policy Statement, 2020, came into effect on May 1, 2020. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. Part IV: Vision for Ontario's Land Use Planning System, includes that "Efficient development patterns optimize the use of land, resources and public investment in infrastructure and public service facilities."

Most relevant to these applications, Policy Section 1.0 – Building Strong Healthy Communities speaks to efficient land use and development patterns that support sustainability by promoting strong, liveable, healthy and resilient communities, protecting the environment and public health and safety, and facilitating economic growth.

Policy 1.1.1 of the PPS promotes creating and sustaining healthy, liveable and safe communities. This is achieved in part by promoting efficient development and land use patterns which sustain the financial well-being of the Province and municipalities over the long term, and also by accommodating an appropriate affordable and market-based range and mix of residential types [1.1.1 a), b)]. Furthermore, promoting the integration of land use planning, growth management, transit-supportive development, intensification and infrastructure planning to achieve cost-effective development patterns, optimization of transit investments, and standards to minimize land consumption and servicing costs (1.1.1 e); and ensuring that necessary infrastructure and public service facilities are or will be available to meet current and projected needs. Also noted are promoting development and land use patterns that conserve biodiversity [1.1.1 h].

Section 1.1.3 (Settlement Areas) further states that "It is in the interest of all communities to use land and resources wisely, to promote efficient development patterns, protect resources, promote green spaces, ensure effective use of infrastructure and public service facilities and minimize unnecessary public expenditures." This sections also adds policies specific to supporting active transportation (1.1.3e) and transit-supportive, where transit is planned, exists or may be developed (1.1.f). Section 1.1.3.4 states that "Appropriate development standards should be promoted which facilitate intensification, redevelopment and compact form, while avoiding or mitigating risks to public health and safety."

Section 1.4 focuses on housing development, providing an appropriate range and mix of housing options and densities to meet projected market-based and affordable housing needs of current and future residents. This section further directs that new housing is to be directed to locations where appropriate levels of infrastructure and public services are and will be available to support anticipated needs [1.4.3 c)].

The proposal to permit the proposed 22 apartment units creating a high density infill residential development on the subject lands is consistent with the policies of the PPS. The proposed development represents a compact form of development within the City's settlement area that will allow the efficient use of land, infrastructure and public service facilities where infrastructure is already available, and transit is available nearby. The proposed four storey residential apartment development provides an alternative to the surrounding mix of lower density residential uses in the immediate area. The proposal contributes to achieving an appropriate range of housing types and densities to help the City of Guelph meet projected requirements for current and future residents.

As the City's Official Plan is to be the main instrument for implementation of the PPS in Guelph [4.7], a more detailed review on how the proposed Official Plan and Zoning By-law amendments are consistent with the above PPS policies as well as policies in the City's Official Plan will be outlined later in this analysis.

Provincial Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (A Place to Grow)

The Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019 (the Growth Plan) is issued under the Places to Grow Act and works to support the achievement of complete communities, manage forecasted population and employment growth, protect the natural environment, and support economic development. While the PPS as outlined above provides broader policy direction on matters of provincial interest, the Growth Plan provides more focused direction for development within the Greater Golden Horseshoe area.

The policies of the Growth Plan focus on the key themes of building more compact and vibrant communities; directing a significant share of new growth to existing built-up areas of the City; promoting the development of transit-supportive densities and the use of active transportation methods; and creating complete communities through ensuring a healthy mix of residential, employment and recreational land uses.

Sections 2.2.1 and 2.2.2 of the Growth Plan identify how population growth to the horizon year of 2041 will be accommodated within the 'Delineated Built-up Areas' of the City. The subject lands are located within the Delineated Built-up Area. These sections contain policies related to intensification, the creation of complete communities and efficient use of infrastructure and public service facilities.

Section 2.2.3 of the Growth Plan directs growth to Urban Growth Centres, and Guelph as an Urban Growth Centre is identified to have a combined 150 people and jobs per hectare in the Downtown.

The proposed Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment conforms to the policies of these sections by:

- Directing redevelopment and intensification to lands within the existing delineated built-up area of the City.
- Focusing growth within a strategic growth area in the City, including identifying the appropriate type and scale of development to occur.
- Promoting redevelopment that supports active and public transportation options.
- Adding new housing units to the neighbourhood that contributes to enhancing and broadening the mix of housing types and options available.
- Further contributing to the mix of land uses in the surrounding area and building a complete community through redevelopment that is in close proximity to existing services, public transit and public open space; and
- Makes efficient use of existing municipal infrastructure and public service facilities.
- Contributing to the downtown densities by adding infill residential development in the downtown.

Section 2.2.6 outlines policies for housing throughout the Greater Golden Horseshoe, which include the following policies:

- Policy 2.2.6.1 supports housing choice through the achievement of the minimum intensification and density targets of the Growth Plan, land use planning and financial tools, aligning land use planning with housing and homelessness plans, and through official plan policies, designations and zoning by-laws.
- Policy 2.2.6.2 expands on the previous policy to support the achievement of complete communities through intensification, meeting density targets, considering the range and mix of housing options and densities of the existing housing stock, and planning to diversify overall housing stocks across a municipality.
- Policy 2.2.6.3 states that to “support the achievement of complete communities, municipalities will consider the use of available tools to require that multi-unit residential developments incorporate a mix of unit sizes to accommodate a diverse range of household sizes and incomes.”

The application proposes 22 apartment units in a mix of sizes and number of bedrooms, contributing to the range and mix of housing options and unit types through intensification. One-, two- and three-bedroom apartment units are proposed contributing to the diversification of housing stock available in the community.

Overall, the proposed infill development is a compact and efficient form of development that will be served by adequate transit, infrastructure and public service facilities in the immediate built-up neighbourhood. The development will contribute to the overall intensification of the City’s built-up area to meet the minimum requirement, increasing the density on the subject lands to 150 units per hectare.

Based on the above summary of policies, Planning staff are of the opinion that the proposed Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendments are consistent with and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe.

Official Plan Conformity

The subject site is within the Downtown Secondary Plan (DSP) and is designated as "Residential 1". The DSP is founded on a series of eight (8) principles, each with its own objectives and targets meant to measure future development.

Most relevant to this application is Principle 2: Set the Scene for Living Well Downtown. Its objectives and targets are focused on adding population growth to the downtown and creating a vibrant and diverse Downtown neighbourhood, with compact residential development, a diversity of housing types, and ensuring that new development is well served by commercial and community amenities.

The proposed development meets the intent of this principle by providing an efficient and compact residential development within the DSP. The proposed development adds population and intensification to the Downtown that contributes to downtown population growth targets. The smaller-scale apartment type of dwelling unit also contributes to the diversification of the housing types available within the community and adds to the mix of unit types and sizes available. The Site is within walking distance to the commercial core of Downtown and within it, a variety of commercial and recreation amenities. The site is also well located for encouraging active transportation and is within walking distance of several transit options, including inter-regional bus and rail transit. Parks and trails are also located nearby, together with a portion of the Active Transportation Network which is accessed nearby along the Speed River.

The site is designated "Residential 1", which permits a range of low-rise forms of housing in accordance with the previous Official Plan policies related to the General Residential land use designation. The General Residential land use designation has a maximum density of 100 units per hectare. The Downtown Secondary Plan Height Map (Schedule D) also limits the height of residential developments to a range of two to four storeys in this area. A site-specific Official Plan amendment is required to permit the proposed maximum density of 150 units per hectare.

According to Section 1.3.14, in the consideration of Official Plan Amendment applications, Council must consider the following criteria:

- i) conformity of the proposal to the strategic directions of this Plan and whether the proposal is deemed to be in the overall interests of the City;

The proposed Official Plan Amendments to permit a maximum net density of 150 units per hectare, conforms to the strategic goals of the Official Plan (March 2020 Consolidation) in Section 2.2, including the following:

- Contributing to providing an appropriate range, mix and geographic distribution of housing types to meet current and projected needs to the year 2031 [2.2.1 b), 2.2.5 d)];
- Provides for urban growth and land use patterns in a manner that ensures the efficient use of public expenditures over the long term [2.2.1 c)];
- Contribute to implementing actions to achieve the targets of the updated Community Energy Initiative [2.2.2 d)];
- Facilitates development in an area where full municipal services and related infrastructure is readily available [2.2.4 a)];
- Ensure that an adequate supply, range and geographic distribution of housing types including affordable housing, special needs housing and supporting amenities are provided to satisfy the needs of the community. 2.2.5 d)
- Build a compact, mixed-use and transit-supportive community [2.2.6 b)];
- Plan and design an attractive urban landscape that reinforces and enhances Guelph's sense of place and identity while encouraging innovative design and development opportunities [2.2.6 c)]; and
- Encouraging intensification and redevelopment of existing urban areas that is compatible with the existing built form [2.2.6 d)].

ii) consistency with applicable provincial legislation, plans and policy statements;

As noted earlier, Planning staff have reviewed the proposal against the policies of the 2020 Provincial Policy Statement and A Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (2019) and are satisfied that it is consistent with both.

iii) suitability of the site or area for the proposed use, particularly in relation to other sites or areas of the city;

The site is suitable for the proposed 4 storey, 22 apartment unit building. It is an area surrounded by a mix of residential and employment uses, close to transit and within the Downtown.

iv) compatibility of the proposed use with adjacent land use designations;

The proposed use, a four storey, 22-unit apartment building is compatible with the mix of residential housing types existing and proposed in the area. Compatibility is further discussed below in "Criteria for Multi-Unit Residential Buildings"

v) the need for the proposed use, in light of projected population and employment targets;

The proposed apartment building would contribute to meeting the City's population targets as a whole and within the Built Boundary.

vi) the market feasibility of the proposed use, where appropriate;

The applicant has determined the proposal is feasible for the site as requested.

vii) the extent to which the existing areas of the city designated for the proposed use are developed or are available for development;

The site is an opportunity within the neighbourhood for infill redevelopment, as an underused industrial building being replaced by a four storey, 22-unit apartment building.

viii) the impact of the proposed use on sewage, water and solid waste management systems, the transportation system, community facilities and the Natural Heritage System;

Engineering staff have determined that adequate water and wastewater servicing capacity is currently available for the proposed development. No improvements are needed to transportation systems to accommodate the development, and the City's three stream waste collection service will be used. The proposed redevelopment does not impact any community facilities or the Natural Heritage System.

Planning staff note that the site is part of the Two-Zone Flood Fringe, which is identified in the Official Plan as lands that lie outside the floodway but within the regulatory floodlines. Redevelopment is permitted within the flood fringe but its subject to being floodproofed to the regulatory flood level, as per the requirements of the Grand River Conservation Authority.

ix) the financial implications of the proposed development;

Financial implications of the proposed development are outlined in the covering report in terms of estimated development charges and taxes.

x) other matters as deemed relevant in accordance with the policies of this Plan.

Consideration of other relevant matters is given in this planning analysis.

Criteria for Multi-Unit Residential Buildings

General criteria for multi-unit residential buildings and intensification within existing residential neighbourhoods are contained in Policy 9.3.1.1 and are to be used to assess development proposals for multi-unit residential development.

The analysis below demonstrates how each of the eleven criteria are met for the proposed four storey, 22-unit apartment development.

- 1. Building form, scale, height, setbacks, massing, appearance and siting are compatible in design, character and orientation with buildings in the immediate vicinity.*

The surrounding area is an eclectic mix of lower rise residential, and small commercial or employment uses, on a variety of lot sizes and lot frontages, often with buildings set close to the street. South of the site along Duke Street, there are a variety of one and two storey dwellings set close to the street. South of the site along Alice Street are several single detached lots

that have relatively small frontages but have far deeper rear yards than average, some of which abut the south or east side of the 66 Duke Street site. To the north of the subject site is a large industrial site that is expected to be redeveloped for predominantly residential uses at some point in the future.

The building is a low-rise apartment building, four storeys in height, in keeping with the Downtown Secondary Plan Height Map and the low-rise nature of the surrounding area. The proposed development is oriented to Duke Street, with a main front entrance, windows and balconies facing the street at a similar setback to the existing housing to the south of the site. The applicant has shifted the proposed building slightly to the north, to create a 3.4 metre side yard setback to the residential properties to the south. The development as proposed is compatible with the character of the surrounding neighbourhood by maintaining a pedestrian scale, appropriate street presence while contributing to the diversity of building types and architectural styles found in the area.

2. *Proposals for residential lot infill will be compatible with the general frontage of lots in the immediate vicinity.*

The development proposal will not be creating new infill lots, so this provision does not apply.

3. *The residential development can be adequately served by local convenience and neighbourhood shopping facilities, schools, trails, parks recreation facilities and public transit.*

There are many walkable shops and services available in the downtown area as well as some smaller shops and services nearby along Elizabeth Street. The site is near a Catholic Elementary School (Sacred Heart) and Tytler Public School, which is not being used as a school right now but as a community hub.

The closest park is John Galt Park and the Downtown Trail that runs along the Speed River, then York Road Park and the interconnected trails along the Eramosa River. The site is also in walking distance to Mico Valeriot Park off Elizabeth Street.

The site is near transit routes on Elizabeth Street and Ontario Street and is approximately an 11-minute walk to Guelph Central Station for additional bus and rail transit options.

4. *Vehicular traffic generated from the proposed development will not have an unacceptable impact on the planned function of the adjacent roads and intersections.*

Traffic staff have reviewed the proposal and found that there will be no unacceptable impact on the planned function of adjacent roads and intersections from the proposed redevelopment of the site for 22 apartment units.

5. *Vehicular access, parking and circulation can be adequately provided and impacts mitigated.*

Vehicular access is provided to the site from Duke Street to parking spaces within the building at grade and through to additional parking in the rear yard of the building. A total of 22 parking spaces are provided on site.

A parking study was provided that noted given the location within the downtown, the number of nearby transit options, and the potential for transportation demand management opportunities, that a reduced parking ratio can be supported here. Planning staff agree with these findings and further discuss parking in the proposed specialized zoning regulations below.

6. *That adequate municipal infrastructure, services and amenity areas for residents can be provided.*

Engineering staff have determined that adequate water and wastewater servicing capacity is currently available for the proposed development. Engineering staff have reviewed the proposal and are satisfied with the proposed onsite servicing plan. The applicant has indicated in their preliminary engineering drawings that stormwater will be entirely accommodated for on-site. The site is near the downtown for local services and adequate on-site amenity area has been provided for the future residents via both interior and rooftop amenity areas.

7. *Surface parking and driveways shall be minimized.*

The site has an efficient layout, with one driveway access to the site from Duke Street and the majority of parking is proposed to be located within the structure on the first storey with some limited surface parking (four spaces) to the rear of the building.

8. *Development shall extend, establish or reinforce a publicly accessible street grid network to ensure appropriate connectivity for pedestrians, cyclist and vehicular traffic, where applicable.*

No new public streets or connections are proposed on the site, given its location and relatively small size.

9. *Impacts on adjacent properties are minimized in relation to grading, drainage, location of service areas and microclimatic conditions, such as wind and shadowing.*

There are no impacts anticipated to adjacent properties related to the grading, drainage and servicing of this site, nor of microclimatic conditions at the proposed four storeys in height.

10. *The development addresses public safety, identified public views and accessibility to open space, parks, trails, and the Natural Heritage System, where applicable.*

The proposed infill redevelopment does not impact public safety, identified public views or accessibility to any open or natural spaces.

11. *The conservation and integration of cultural heritage resources, including identified key public views can be achieved subject to the provisions of the Cultural Heritage Resources Section of this Plan.*

The existing one-storey industrial building is not a cultural heritage resource and would be demolished to redevelop the site as proposed.

Community Energy Initiative Update (2019) and Climate Change

Section 4.7 of the Official Plan contains policies on Community Energy. Policy 4.7.4.1 of the Official Plan indicates that the City will utilize the development approvals process, such as site plan control, to ensure that new residential development includes sustainable design features.

The applicant has indicated to Planning staff that they will be including energy efficiency measures within the apartment building, consistent with the City's Community Energy Initiative (CEI) 2019 update. These initiatives proposed by the applicant will contribute to the City meeting its goal to become a net zero community by 2050. A summary of key measures is included Attachment 10.

Staff are recommending a condition to be implemented at site plan review that the applicant shall provide a commitment to incorporate the proposed features into the development that will contribute to meeting the action items from the CEI (see condition #36 in Attachment 3). Specifically, the applicant will need to consider how they will contribute to CEI Action 1, which is to incrementally increase the number of net zero homes to 100% by 2031.

Affordable Housing

The City's Affordable Housing Strategy (AHS) sets an annual City-wide 30% target for housing that is affordable with the goal of ensuring that affordable housing is included in the range and mix of housing provided for all households across the

City. The goals and objectives of the AHS have also been incorporated into the Official Plan in Section 7.2 (Affordable Housing). These policies are intended to encourage and support the development of affordable housing throughout the city by planning for a range of housing types, forms, tenures and densities and have been applied to the review of this proposed residential development application.

The 2020 affordable housing ownership benchmark purchase price is \$420,125. It is anticipated that some of the smaller or 1 bedroom apartment units proposed at 66 Duke Street would sell for less than the benchmark and would contribute directly to the supply of affordable housing. The site is located in an area near transit and within the Downtown, providing the opportunity for an affordable lifestyle for future tenants.

Staff note that the proposed Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendments are to allow the development of apartment units, but the actual contribution to housing affordability can only be measured as the units are sold. Zoning provisions cannot be used to ensure the units are affordable or to control the tenure of the units.

Review of the Proposed Zoning

The applicant is proposing to rezone the property to a specialized R.1D-12 (Infill Apartment) Zone. The applicant has requested several specialized regulations to permit the development as proposed, related to density, side and rear yard setbacks, parking and floor space index. Planning staff have also recommended regulations related to visitor parking and rooftop amenity area to better confirm the planned function of the site.

Density and Floor Space Index:

The applicant has requested a maximum density for the site of 150 units per hectare, in line with the requested Official Plan Amendment. The proposed density would permit the development of 22 apartment dwelling units. As discussed above in the planning analysis, staff are supportive of the proposed amendments to increase density, which creates additional dwelling units while meeting the height requirements of the Downtown Secondary Plan and maintaining the character of the surrounding area.

Similarly, the applicant has requested a specialized regulation to permit a higher Floor Space Index (FSI), which is a measure of building Gross Floor Area (GFA) compared to the lot area. The standard zoning regulations require a maximum FSI of 2.0, which means that the GFA can be a maximum of 2.0 times the lot area. The applicant has requested a specialized regulation of a maximum FSI of 2.2. Planning staff have no objection to this regulation as proposed because the increase is relatively minor and allows for a diversity of dwelling unit sizes as proposed.

Rear Yard, Side Yard and Rooftop Amenity Setbacks:

Reduced requirements for minimum side yards have also been proposed. Originally, the applicant proposed that the northerly side yard be 3.4 metres wide, and the southerly side yard be 3 metres wide. The applicant has shifted the building slightly to the north and now proposes that the southerly side yard be 3.4 metres wide and

the northerly side yard by 3 metres wide. Planning staff have no objection to this specialized regulation for reduced side yards, because on the north side of the site, the existing industrial building is not impacted, and on the south side of the site, 3.4 metres provides adequate separation from the adjacent residential property, with room for residents to access the side of the building if needed and for fencing and screening to be provided. The applicant has designed the building to have no balconies on the second storey facing south to address overlook/privacy concerns and Planning Staff have recommended that the proposed rooftop amenity area be setback an additional 2 metres from the south building face to further reduce any overlook concerns related to residents using the amenity area.

The rear yard also has a requested reduction from 12 metres to 8.1 metres. Planning staff have no objection to the proposed reduction because it provides adequate separation of the building from the adjacent lands and does not negatively impact the adjacent rear yards. The proposed rear yard will only be used for parking up to four cars and not as standard rear yard amenity area which is located internal to the building and on the rooftop.

Parking:

A total of 22 spaces are provided in the proposed development, or a ratio of one space per unit. The standard Zoning By-law requirement for parking for apartment uses in the R.4D Zone is 1.5 spaces per unit for the first 20 units and 1.25 spaces per unit for any units above 20, inclusive of visitor parking. For the 22 proposed units, 33 parking spaces are required.

Staff can support this reduction in required parking given its location and ability for residents to walk, cycle or use transit. The site's close proximity to the services in the rest of Downtown, and the availability of nearby transit routes as well as being within walking distance to Guelph Central Station for additional bus and rail transit options makes it viable without the standard parking requirements in the Zoning By-law.

Staff recommend an additional regulation that two of the proposed 22 parking spaces be reserved for visitors. This will require the site to be developed incorporating Transportation Demand Management measures to reduce the expected parking load, such as unbundling parking so future residents are not required to purchase parking and to consider incorporating other incentives for future residents to use alternative transportation options instead of private vehicles.

Staff note that the standard Downtown Zones, which do not apply to this site, require parking for apartment uses at a rate of 1.05 per unit, with one (1) space per unit for residents and an additional 0.05 spaces per unit for visitors. The Downtown Zoning By-law would require 22 spaces for the residents and 1.1 spaces (rounded up to two spaces) for visitors for a total of 24 spaces.

The City's Zoning By-law does not have requirements for bicycle parking for the R4.D Zone, but the Downtown Zoning By-law has requirements for bicycle parking in new development. Long term parking for residents is required at a rate of 0.68 spaces per unit (or 15 spaces for 22 units) and short-term parking for visitors is

required at a rate of 0.07 spaces per unit (or two spaces for 22 units). Bicycle parking for the site is proposed at the Downtown Zoning By-law rate (17 spaces). Planning staff recommend adding this regulation to the proposed specialized R.4D Zone to ensure that adequate bicycle parking is provided.

Planning staff have added a site plan condition in Attachment-3 (Condition #37) to consider additional Transportation Demand Management (TDM) measures that could reduce the reliance on cars for travel to and from the site. Considerations include connecting the site as well as possible to the surrounding network for pedestrians and cyclists, unbundling parking so that it is sold or rented separately from the residential unit, providing additional bicycle parking, and providing incentives for residents to use transit like up-to-date transit information and transit passes. These measures will be reviewed with TDM staff and incorporated into the site plan.

The applicant also requested a reduction in parking space size within a garage, from 3 metres by 6 metres to 2.75 metres by 5.5 metres in size. This is frequent request from proposed residential parking garages and staff have supported this request on several other recent developments and have no objection to the proposed regulation change, nor concern about parking function.

Comments Received on the Applications

The Statutory Public Meeting for the proposed Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment was held on October 13, 2020. Questions and issues raised include the impact of reduced parking requirements, bicycle parking, density, affordable housing, side and rear yard reductions, unit sizes, privacy, tree protection, and waste management. Most of these issues have been already addressed above.

Tree Protection

A concern was raised about the trees along and adjacent to the property line. Landscape Planning staff have reviewed the proposed plan and will require a Tree Inventory and Preservation Plan as part of the site plan application and the applicant will need to work with the neighbouring property owners to determine the best course of action for boundary trees. Landscape Planning and Urban Design staff will also review options for landscaping and screening of the rear and side yards to the adjacent properties as part of the site plan application.

Front Façade/Garage

Concerns were also raised about the front façade of the building and that the garage entrance was more prominent than the pedestrian entrance to the building. The architect has revised the front elevation of the proposed building by providing additional glazing along the ground floor to bring more of a focus to the pedestrian entrance to the site. The revised front façade is shown in Attachment-8.