

Staff Report



To	City Council
Service Area	Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
Date	Monday, June 13, 2022
Subject	15 Forbes Avenue - Heritage Permit (HP22-0002) for Detached Additional Residential Dwelling Unit and Detached Garage

Recommendation

1. That Heritage Permit HP22-0002 to construct a detached additional residential dwelling unit and new detached garage at 15 Forbes Avenue be approved.

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

This report provides the staff recommendation to approve a heritage permit application for the construction of a rear yard, detached additional residential dwelling unit and detached garage at 15 Forbes Avenue which is located within the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District.

Key Findings

The proposed construction is subject to the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Plan and Guidelines. The heritage permit was deemed to be a major permit application that has achieved support from Heritage Guelph and is subject to approval by Council.

The proposed design of the rear yard detached additional residential dwelling and detached garage satisfies the plan and guidelines for the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District and staff recommend approval.

Financial Implications

The accessory building once completed will be assessed by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation and appropriately taxed by the City.

Report

The subject property is located on the north side of Forbes Avenue (Attachment-1) within the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District, as such, it is designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act through By-law (2014)-19812.

According to Section 42 of the Ontario Heritage Act, any proposed new construction, alteration, demolition or removal that would affect the heritage character of the property or the district is required to obtain approval through the

heritage permit process. The construction of the two new buildings on the subject property requires a heritage permit application (as per Section 4.4 of the HCD Plan and Guidelines) and Council approval.

Planning staff have no concern regarding the proposed replacement of the existing garage building on the subject property as the former outbuilding shown on the 1929 Fire Insurance Plan had been significantly remodelled prior to the approval of the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD and only retains its basic original form and not its original height, original windows, doors and exterior materials. Staff are of the opinion that although the replacement garage is longer than the existing garage, it would have a similar compatibility of size and scale to the principal dwelling. The use of a steel roof and Maibec siding in a board and batten style is an appropriate choice of exterior materials for the proposed replacement garage.

Planning staff are of the opinion that the additional residential dwelling unit proposed for 15 Forbes Avenue has been designed with a height and form that is secondary to that of the existing house and would use exterior materials that are inspired and compatible with the red brick house in a simplified interpretation of historic form and style for a secondary building. The HCD Plan and Guidelines recommend that the visual relationships between new buildings and structures, neighbouring buildings and the streetscape should be reviewed carefully and used as the basis for new construction. The size and placement of this simple, single-storey gable roof form would not stand out when the property is seen from the street and is compatible with the 2-storey, red brick house.

Planning staff is of the opinion that heritage permit HP22-0002 for the construction of the proposed detached additional residential dwelling unit and new detached garage at 15 Forbes Avenue are in keeping with proper heritage conservation practice and satisfy the following guidelines from the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD Plan:

4.1 Guidelines for Additions to Heritage Buildings

viii) New design of alterations may be permitted where they:

- do not harm, damage or remove valued heritage property, features and other distinguishing historical, architectural, streetscape or cultural features, and
- are of size, location and material that is compatible with the character of the property, building, landscape or streetscape
- are compatible with, distinguishable from, and subordinate to the original.

ix) Construction comprising new freestanding building masses within the heritage conservation district should fit with the prevailing character of adjacent properties, landscaping and existing grades and be compatible in design, size, location, height, setback, orientation to the street, materials, roof type, and fenestration; and

4.2.2 Location of additions

Exterior additions are encouraged to be located at the rear or on an inconspicuous side of the building, limited in size and scale to complement the existing buildings and neighbouring properties. Multi-storey exterior additions are best set back as deeply as possible from the existing front wall

plane in order to be unobtrusive in the streetscape and to differentiate the addition from the older structure.

The design as presented satisfies the requirements of the heritage district designation plan and guidelines. Heritage permit application HP22-0002 is recommended for approval under section 42 of Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Financial Implications

The accessory building once completed will be assessed by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation and appropriately taxed by the City.

Consultations

Heritage Guelph reviewed the application at their meeting of February 28, 2022 and passed the following motion:

That Heritage Guelph supports the property owner's proposal to construct a detached additional residential dwelling and new detached garage at 15 Forbes Avenue, as proposed in the site plan and elevation drawings of heritage permit application HP22-0002 presented at the February 28, 2022 meeting of Heritage Guelph; and,

That any modifications necessary to complete the designs that are minor in nature may be dealt with by the Senior Heritage Planner.

Strategic Plan Alignment

Priority

Building our Future

Direction

Continue to build strong, vibrant, safe and healthy communities that foster resilience in the people who live here

Alignment

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is aligned with building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities

Attachments

Attachment-1 Location of Subject Property

Attachment-2 Property Shown on 1929 Fire Insurance Plan of Guelph

Attachment-3 Current Photos of Property

Attachment-4 Design of Proposed Detached Additional Dwelling Unit and Detached Garage

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate, MCIP, RPP, Manager, Policy Planning and Urban Design

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, Senior Heritage Planner

This report was approved by

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP
General Manager, Planning and Building Services
Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
519-837-5615, extension 2395
krista.walkey@guelph.ca

This report was recommended by

Jayne Holmes, P. Eng., PMP
Deputy Chief Administrative Officer
Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
519-822-1260 extension 2248
jayne.holmes@guelph.ca