50-60 Fife Road: Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment for proposed demolition

A Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment (CHRIA) has been submitted in support of an intention to demolish application for the existing building at 50-60 Fife Road. The proponent UpBuilding! Non-Profit Homes (Guelph) Inc. proposes to replace the existing building with two new buildings with 18 residential units.

As described in the CHRIA, the subject property is located on the south side of Fife Road west of Wellington Street. The building is listed as non-designated on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The heritage register record and current photos of the subject building are included in this report.

The CHRIA provides an impressive account of the history of the subject property and has added substantially to what has been a very limited understanding of the cultural heritage value of the building.

Heritage Planning staff are not of the opinion that there is significant physical cultural heritage value in the portion of the building that was the Richard Jackson residence (as it no longer exists) or in the 2-storey, brick addition built in 1903 by Mary-Ellen Watson and used as a pickle factory.

Heritage Planning staff are of the opinion that the cultural heritage value of the building is in the extant elements of the former residence of F. W. Chadwick – a significant figure in the history of the City of Guelph. Staff are disinclined to be supportive of the loss of the corner tower of the building. This heritage attribute is architecturally distinctive and a rare extant example of mid-Victorian rural residential design that was built for a very prominent figure in the history of Guelph. The act of covering the tower exterior with stucco would be difficult and costly to reverse but this cladding does not completely negate the cultural heritage value of the tower as it is still very much a recognizable heritage character-defining element that is still visible from Fife Road. Staff recommend that the proponent consider ways to retain and integrate the tower element of the F. W. Chadwick house into the design of the new buildings.

This proposed demolition of a building listed on the register will be considered by Council in accordance with the requirements of the Ontario Heritage Act. Upon receipt of a complete application Council has 60 days to consult with Heritage Guelph and make a decision whether to protect portions of the listed built heritage resource by publishing an intention to designate under the Ontario Heritage Act. Council will consider this application in July.

Recommendations:

THAT Heritage Guelph receive the Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment by Megan Hobson (dated April 16, 2022) submitted in support of the proposed demolition of the listed built heritage resource at 50-60 Fife Road, and

THAT Heritage Guelph supports staff's recommendation that the proponent consider ways to retain and integrate the tower element of the F. W. Chadwick house into the design of the new buildings.

That Heritage Guelph advises that the property be retained on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties with a revision of the property description limited to the tower portion.

That Heritage Guelph supports staff's recommendation that the tower element of the F.W. Chadwick house be retained and that partial demolition be approved.

Record from Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties

50-60 Fife Rd

PT LT C CON 2 DIVISION E GUELPH TOWNSHIP PTS 1 & 2, 61R5558; S/T RO662529; GUELPH

Built c. 1865

Italianate, 2 storey, irregular plan, round tower with band courses, bracketed eaves to conical patterned slate roof.



Current photos of listed built heritage resource at 50-60 Fife Road









