

Attachment-9 Planning Analysis

Provincial Policy Statement, 2020

The Provincial Policy Statement, 2020, came into effect on May 1, 2020. The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) provides direction on matters of provincial interest related to land use planning and development. Part IV: Vision for Ontario's Land Use Planning System, includes that "Efficient development patterns optimize the use of land, resources and public investment in infrastructure and public service facilities."

Most relevant to these applications, Policy Section 1.0 – Building Strong Healthy Communities speaks to efficient land use and development patterns that support sustainability by promoting strong, liveable, healthy and resilient communities, protecting the environment and public health and safety, and facilitating economic growth.

Policy 1.1.1 of the PPS promotes creating and sustaining healthy, liveable and safe communities. This is achieved in part by promoting efficient development and land use patterns which sustain the financial well-being of the Province and municipalities over the long term, and also by accommodating an appropriate affordable and market-based range and mix of residential types [1.1.1 a), b)]. Furthermore, promoting the integration of land use planning, growth management, transit-supportive development, intensification and infrastructure planning to achieve cost-effective development patterns, optimization of transit investments, and standards to minimize land consumption and servicing costs (1.1.1 e); and ensuring that necessary infrastructure and public service facilities are or will be available to meet current and projected needs. Also noted are promoting development and land use patterns that conserve biodiversity [1.1.1 h].

Section 1.1.3 (Settlement Areas) further states that "It is in the interest of all communities to use land and resources wisely, to promote efficient development patterns, protect resources, promote green spaces, ensure effective use of infrastructure and public service facilities and minimize unnecessary public expenditures." This sections also adds policies specific to supporting active transportation (1.1.3e) and transit-supportive, where transit is planned, exists or may be developed (1.1.f). Section 1.1.3.4 states that "Appropriate development standards should be promoted which facilitate intensification, redevelopment and compact form, while avoiding or mitigating risks to public health and safety."

Section 1.4 focuses on housing development, providing an appropriate range and mix of housing options and densities to meet projected market-based and affordable housing needs of current and future residents. This section further directs that new housing is to be directed to locations where appropriate levels of infrastructure and public services are and will be available to support anticipated needs [1.4.3 c)].

The proposal to permit 193 apartment units and 2 commercial units creating a high-density mixed-use development on the subject lands is consistent with the policies of the PPS. The proposed development represents a compact form of development within the City's settlement area that will allow the efficient use of land, infrastructure and public service facilities where infrastructure is already available, and transit is available nearby. The site was already approved for a 14-storey mixed use development in 2014, and the proposed zoning regulation changes have minimal impact to the site's conformity to the Provincial Policy Statement. The proposal contributes to achieving an appropriate range of housing types and densities to help the City of Guelph meet projected requirements for current and future residents.

Provincial Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (A Place to Grow)

The Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, 2019 (the Growth Plan) is issued under the Places to Grow Act and works to support the achievement of complete communities, manage forecasted population and employment growth, protect the natural environment, and support economic development. While the PPS as outlined above provides broader policy direction on matters of provincial interest, the Growth Plan provides more focused direction for development within the Greater Golden Horseshoe area.

The policies of the Growth Plan focus on the key themes of building more compact and vibrant communities; directing a significant share of new growth to existing built-up areas of the City; promoting the development of transit-supportive densities and the use of active transportation methods; and creating complete communities through ensuring a healthy mix of residential, employment and recreational land uses.

Sections 2.2.1 and 2.2.2 of the Growth Plan identify how population growth to the horizon year of 2041 will be accommodated within the 'Delineated Built-up Areas' of the City. The subject lands are located within the Delineated Built-up Area. These sections contain policies related to intensification, the creation of complete communities and efficient use of infrastructure and public service facilities.

Section 2.2.3 of the Growth Plan directs growth to Urban Growth Centres, and Guelph as an Urban Growth Centre is identified to have a combined 150 people and jobs per hectare in the Downtown.

The proposed Zoning By-law Amendment, which is limited to changing specific regulations related to the revised proposal, conforms to the policies of these sections by:

- Directing redevelopment and intensification to lands within the existing delineated built-up area of the city;
- Focusing growth within a strategic growth area in the city, including identifying the appropriate type and scale of development to occur;

- Promoting redevelopment that supports active and public transportation options;
- Adding new housing units to the neighbourhood that contributes to enhancing and broadening the mix of housing types and options available;
- Further contributing to the mix of land uses in the surrounding area and building a complete community through redevelopment that is in close proximity to existing services, public transit and public open space; and
- Makes efficient use of existing municipal infrastructure and public service facilities.
- Contributing to the downtown densities by adding infill residential development in the downtown.

Overall, the proposed infill development is a compact and efficient form of development that will be served by adequate transit, infrastructure and public service facilities in the immediate built-up neighbourhood. The development will contribute to the overall intensification of the city's built-up area and more specifically the Urban Growth Centre. Based on the above summary of policies, Planning staff are of the opinion that the proposed Zoning By-law Amendment is consistent with and conforms to A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe.

Official Plan Conformity

The subject site is designated Residential 2 in the Downtown Secondary Plan policies in the Official Plan, which is intended for high density residential uses in the downtown area and can be combined with small scale commercial uses. The site also has an overlay showing a portion of the floodway on the site closest to the river and the Special Policy Area overlay associated with the floodplain shown on the remainder of the site. Staff have reviewed the proposed revised zoning regulations for the site and are satisfied that the proposed regulations conform with the Official Plan and Downtown Secondary Plan. Further details related to key aspects of the Official Plan, in relation to the proposed revised zoning regulations for the proposed development are noted below.

Criteria for Multi-Unit Residential Buildings

General criteria for multi-unit residential buildings and intensification within existing residential neighbourhoods are contained in Policy 9.3.1.1 and are to be used to assess development proposals for multi-unit residential development. In this case, several aspects of the proposed development remain unchanged from the previously approved zoning. The analysis below demonstrates briefly how each of the eleven criteria are met for the proposed mixed-use development in terms of the proposed changes to the zoning regulations.

1. *Building form, scale, height, setbacks, massing, appearance and siting are compatible in design, character and orientation with buildings in the immediate vicinity.*

The surrounding area is an eclectic mix of lower rise residential uses, on a variety of lot sizes and lot frontages, often with buildings set close to the street. South of the site along Cross Street is a three storey apartment building. There are a variety of one and two storey dwellings set close to the street along Arthur Street South.

The proposed building already has zoning that permits 14 storeys in height. The zoning limits also floorplate sizes of the upper floors so the building steps back from the street, limiting the impact of the height on the surrounding area. The applicant is proposing slight increases in allowable floorplate sizes, which are further discussed in the zoning section of this analysis below. Staff have reviewed the submitted shadow study and are satisfied that the proposed increases to floorplate size are minor and do not cause additional impacts to the surround neighbourhood from a shadowing standpoint.

A related concern was raised at the public meeting, regarding the need for these amendments versus the fit or compatibility of the proposal with what was originally approved for the site. Staff note that the building envelope is approximately the same size as what was approved, with the exception of the slightly enlarged floorplates of floors 7-14. Staff find that this increase is minor in terms of impact and is generally in keeping with what was approved in the Urban Design Master Plan. The key difference is that some of the parking (78 of 205 required parking spaces) is provided off-site at 92 Arthur, permitting more units to be developed on site, and subsequently more parking required.

2. *Proposals for residential lot infill will be compatible with the general frontage of lots in the immediate vicinity.*

The development proposal will not be creating new infill lots, so this provision does not apply.

3. *The residential development can be adequately served by local convenience and neighbourhood shopping facilities, schools, trails, parks recreation facilities and public transit.*

The site itself is proposed to be mixed-use, with two commercial units on the ground floor. There are many walkable shops and services available in the downtown area as well as some smaller shops and services nearby along Elizabeth Street. The site is near a Catholic Elementary School (Sacred Heart) and Tytler Public School, which is not being used as a school right now but as a community hub.

River Square and the completion of the Riverwalk Area will be immediately adjacent to the subject site. The closest existing park is John Galt Park and

the Downtown Trail that runs along the Speed River, then York Road Park and the interconnected trails along the Eramosa River.

The site is near transit on Neeve Street just south of Cross Street and is approximately a 10-minute walk to Guelph Central Station for additional bus and rail transit options.

4. *Vehicular traffic generated from the proposed development will not have an unacceptable impact on the planned function of the adjacent roads and intersections.*

Traffic staff have reviewed the proposal and found that there will be no unacceptable impact on the planned function of adjacent roads and intersections. The original rezoning of the larger Metalworks site in 2014 included intersection improvements and no changes have been identified as a result of this application.

5. *Vehicular access, parking and circulation can be adequately provided and impacts mitigated.*

Vehicular access is proposed on-site from Cross Street and 127 parking spaces are proposed to be located within a partial below grade and two above grade parking levels. The rest of the required parking is proposed to be located in the existing surface parking lot at 92 Arthur Street, which is proposed to contain 78 parking space for the exclusive use of 93 Arthur Street and an additional 19 parking spaces that could be used for additional commercial and visitor parking for the entire Metalworks development. Detailed analysis of the proposed parking regulations is included in the zoning section of the report below. Planning staff are satisfied with the proposed specialized parking regulations as set out in Attachment-3 of this report.

6. *That adequate municipal infrastructure, services and amenity areas for residents can be provided.*

Engineering staff are satisfied that adequate water and wastewater servicing capacity is available for the proposed development. The existing zoning has an associated Holding Provision with one of the conditions being that Engineering staff confirm servicing capacity. This has been completed through this review process.

Engineering staff have reviewed the proposal and are satisfied with the proposed on-site servicing plan. The site is near the downtown for local services and adequate on-site private and common amenity areas have been provided for the future residents and shared public spaces are available with the Riverwalk, River Square and nearby trails.

7. *Surface parking and driveways shall be minimized.*

Vehicular access is proposed from Cross Street and 127 parking spaces are proposed to be located within a partial below grade and two above grade parking levels, so on site surface parking and driveways are minimized. The rest of the required parking is proposed to be located in the existing surface parking lot at 92 Arthur Street, which is proposed to contain 78 parking space for the exclusive use of 93 Arthur Street and an additional 19 parking spaces that could be used for additional commercial and visitor parking for the entire Metalworks development.

8. *Development shall extend, establish or reinforce a publicly accessible street grid network to ensure appropriate connectivity for pedestrians, cyclist and vehicular traffic, where applicable.*

No new public streets or connections are proposed on the site, though there is good connectivity for pedestrians and cyclists to the surrounding street network, the Riverwalk and nearby trail system on the west side of the river.

9. *Impacts on adjacent properties are minimized in relation to grading, drainage, location of service areas and microclimatic conditions, such as wind and shadowing.*

There are no impacts anticipated to adjacent properties related to the grading, drainage and servicing of this site, nor of microclimatic conditions. The 2014 rezoning permitted the 14-storey height on site and this height remains unchanged.

10. *The development addresses public safety, identified public views and accessibility to open space, parks, trails, and the Natural Heritage System, where applicable.*

The proposed infill redevelopment does not impact public safety, identified public views or accessibility to any open or natural spaces.

11. *The conservation and integration of cultural heritage resources, including identified key public views can be achieved subject to the provisions of the Cultural Heritage Resources Section of this Plan.*

Cultural heritage resources were considered in the previous 2014 rezoning of the entire Metalworks site, this site is currently vacant.

Community Energy Initiative Update (2019) and Climate Change

Section 4.7 of the Official Plan contains policies on Community Energy. Policy 4.7.4.1 of the Official Plan indicates that the City will utilize the development

approvals process, such as site plan control, to ensure that new residential development includes sustainable design features.

The applicant has indicated that they will be including energy efficiency measures within the development, consistent with the City's Community Energy Initiative (CEI) 2019 update. These initiatives proposed by the applicant will contribute to the City meeting its goal to become a net zero community by 2050. A summary is included Attachment 10.

Staff are recommending a condition to be implemented at site plan review that the applicant shall provide a commitment to incorporate the proposed features into the development that will contribute to meeting the action items from the CEI (see condition #7 in Attachment 3).

Affordable Housing

The City's Affordable Housing Strategy (AHS) sets an annual City-wide 30% target for housing that is affordable with the goal of ensuring that affordable housing is included in the range and mix of housing provided for all households across the City. The goals and objectives of the AHS have also been incorporated into the Official Plan in Section 7.2 (Affordable Housing). These policies are intended to encourage and support the development of affordable housing throughout the city by planning for a range of housing types, forms, tenures and densities and have been applied to the review of this proposed residential development application.

The 2021 affordable housing ownership benchmark purchase price is \$420,125. It is possible that some of the smaller 1-bedroom apartment units proposed at 93 Arthur Street Street could sell for less than the benchmark and could contribute directly to the supply of affordable housing. The site is located in an area near transit and within the Downtown, providing the opportunity for an affordable lifestyle for future tenants.

Staff note that the actual contribution to housing affordability can only be measured as the units are sold. Zoning provisions cannot be used to ensure the units are affordable or to control the tenure of the units.

Review of the Proposed Zoning

The applicant is proposing to amend and add specialized regulations within the existing R.4B-15.4(H) Zone. The applicant has requested revised specialized regulations to reduce required visitor and public parking.

Parking

Several concerns were raised about parking and the proposed reduction in required parking. Following the public meeting, the applicant revised their requested parking regulations in response to these concerns. The application now proposes reductions in visitor and commercial parking requirements, the permission to park off-site at 92 Arthur Street South, and a reduction in parking space dimensions within a parking garage.

Number of Parking Spaces

Originally the applicant proposed a reduction in parking per dwelling units from the 1.0 that exists today to 0.95 spaces per unit, so not every unit was allocated a parking space. The applicant removed this request and kept the 1.0 parking spaces per unit regulation that exists for the Metalworks site today.

The applicant has also requested a reduction in required visitor and commercial parking. The site is currently required to provide 0.15 visitor spaces per dwelling unit and the applicant is proposing 0.05, or a total of 10 parking spaces for visitors. For the two small commercial units, the applicant is proposing a parking ratio of 1 parking space per 100 square metres of commercial area, where the existing zoning would require 1 parking space per 33 square metres of commercial space. The total amount of commercial space in the two units is expected to be approximately 151 square metres so only two parking spaces for commercial uses would be required with the revised regulations.

The applicant is proposing that visitor and commercial parking be primarily located on the 92 Arthur Street site. This parking lot is expected to accommodate 68 residential parking spaces, 10 visitor parking spaces, 2 commercial parking spaces, and an additional 19 parking spaces that could be used by the public for additional commercial and visitor parking needs.

Staff can support this reduction in required visitor and commercial parking given the additional parking spaces available in the 92 Arthur Street lot. Also, the site's location is well-suited for residents to walk, cycle or use transit. The site is in close proximity to the services in the rest of Downtown, and transit is available nearby as well as being within walking distance to Guelph Central Station for additional bus and rail transit options. Staff note that the applicant is now meeting the standard residential and visitor parking rates for Downtown Zones.

The applicant is also exploring transportation demand management (TDM) measures that could reduce the reliance on cars for travel to and from the site. The site is well-connected to the surrounding network for pedestrians and cyclists and is near transit. The applicant is considering unbundling parking so that it is sold or rented separately from the residential unit and providing incentives for residents to use transit. These measures will be reviewed with TDM staff and incorporated into the site plan.

Off-site Parking

The applicant proposes to use an existing parking lot at 92 Arthur Street South to provide 78 required parking spaces for 93 Arthur Street and 19 additional parking spaces that can be used by visitors or commercial users of the greater Metalworks development.

Parking Space Size

The applicant also requested a reduction in parking space size within a garage, from 3 metres by 6 metres to 2.75 metres by 5.5 metres in size. This is a frequent

request for proposed residential parking garages and staff have supported this request on several other recent developments and have no objection to the proposed regulation change, nor concern about parking function.

Common Amenity Area

The applicant has requested a specialized regulation to permit common amenity area to be located in the front yard. The front yard in this case is located at the corner of Arthur Street South and Cross Street and was identified through the original planning process in 2014 as Mill Square. Mill Square will remain in private ownership, owned long term by the future condominium, but with public access. This area of the site is expected to be used to create a community garden space that can be accessed by both residents and the surrounding neighbourhood. There is also potential for a future patio space for the ground floor commercial unit located on this side of the building. Given the unique and programmed nature of this portion of the site, it will function as shared common amenity area and planning staff have no objection to the proposed specialized regulation.

Accessory Building in the Front Yard

Along with permitting common amenity in the front yard, the applicant has requested that an accessory building be permitted in the front yard which is also Mill Square. The purpose of this building is to have a garden shed that can be accessed by members of the neighbourhood and future residents to store garden implements and supplies for the proposed community garden. Planning staff have no concern with the proposed garden shed and recommend limiting its size to 10m² to ensure it is compatible in terms of scale and fit within the proposed design of the square.

Building Floorplates

Two changes have been requested to increase the floorplate limits that exist in the current zoning for the site:

- Above the 6th Storey: 1238 m² where 1200 is permitted
- Above the 8th Storey: 1045 m² where 1000 is permitted

The increase in permitted size could result in an additional 38 square metres for each of floors 7 and 8, and an additional 45 square metres for each of floors 9 to 14 of the proposed building. Planning and Urban Design staff have reviewed the requested change together with the proposed shadow study and find the proposed variance to be relatively minor with no measurable difference to shadow impact or streetscape. For these reasons planning staff have no objection to the proposed change.

Rear Yard Setback

A specialized regulation has been requested to permit the building to be setback a minimum of 24 metres from the Speed River Lot Line, which is considered the rear lot line for the site. The building is located appropriately on the site, in accordance with the Urban Design Masterplan. Given the rear yard in this case is the Riverwalk

and River Square, Planning staff have no concern with the proposed specialized regulation.

Existing Holding Provision

The site is currently zoned R.4B-15.4(H), a specialized High Density Residential Zone with a Holding Provision. The holding provision was placed on the original zoning for the development with three (3) conditions to fulfill. First, an Urban Design Brief is required, consistent with the Urban Design Master Plan and an architectural peer review is completed. Second, confirmation from the City that adequate service capacity is available, and last that the owner pay their proportionate share of the cost of municipal services on the streets that front the site.

The applicant has fulfilled all these conditions to the satisfaction of Engineering and Planning staff, so staff recommend that the H does not need to be included in the recommended revised zoning regulations.

Comments Received on the Applications

The Statutory Public Meeting for the proposed Official Plan and Zoning By-law Amendment was held on July 12, 2022. Questions and issues raised include the impact of reduced parking requirements, building height and compatibility, onsite public and private open space, parking podium design, lighting, contribution to the Community Energy Plan goals, conformity with the Official Plan and Urban Design Master Plan, and floorplate sizes. Several of these issues have been addressed earlier in this analysis.

Lighting

The applicant is required to submit a lighting plan through the site plan approval process. The lighting plan is reviewed against the City's Lighting Guidelines to ensure that neighbouring properties are not impacted by the site's lighting.

History of Publicly Accessible Spaces on Site

The Riverwalk and River Square are privately owned and will have a public access easement over them. Mill Square is privately owned but serves multiple roles as a front entrance to this building; a potential commercial patio and an urban square space that is can be accessed by both residents and the neighbourhood. The applicant intends to build a community garden in a portion of the Mill Square lands.

The public access and private ownership of the Riverwalk, River Square and Mill Square were determined through the Zoning By-law Amendment application that went to Council for a decision in 2014, as set out in Report 14-38 from August 25, 2014. At the time, the Zoning By-law was approved with a holding provision and Council direction that City staff enter into an agreement with the developer, registered on title, that outlines the terms of easements for publicly accessible lands and details related to its design, construction and maintenance. A concern was raised that the development was encroaching on the publicly accessible lands,

however, the proposed size and location of the Riverwalk, River Square and Mill Square meet the requirements set out in the agreement.

Staff also note that easements were recommended for the Riverwalk and River Square instead of the more standard parkland dedication and ownership, because of the site's industrial brownfield history. The Certificate of Property Use (CPU) from the Ministry of Environment, sets out that the wall along the river should be retained on the same property as developed lands to best ensure the site's CPU requirements are upheld over the long term.

On the parking lot site at 92 Arthur, a concern was also raised that a future pedestrian connection is identified in this area in the Downtown Secondary Plan Mobility Plan (Schedule A of the DSP). The parking lot does not contain a walkway through the block at this time. Should less parking be required for the site in the future and the parking lot is redeveloped, the option to consider a walkway in this area can be reconsidered, but is not recommended through the parking lot at this time.

Proposed Public and Private Space

Questions were raised around which spaces were intended to be accessed by the public and which were private on the ground level of the site. The applicant has provided the following plan (see Figure 1) which illustrates ground level spaces on the site. The areas highlighted with yellow are publicly accessible spaces, the areas highlighted in blue are common amenity areas for future residents of the building and areas in purple are private amenity spaces for individual dwelling units. The areas in blue and purple are raised above the public areas and accessed via stairs, similar to residential units in earlier phases of the development that front onto the Riverwalk. A concern was raised at the public meeting that portions of the Riverwalk and River Square were raised and potentially inaccessible, but both these areas are designed to be accessible and will meet the requirements of the FADM (Facility Accessibility Design Manual), the City's standards for accessibility.

Figure 1: Proposed Public and Private Ground Floor Spaces

