

Staff Report



To	City Council
Service Area	Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
Date	Wednesday, July 13, 2022
Subject	50-60 Fife Road: Proposed Demolition of Building listed as non-designated on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties

Recommendation

1. That the heritage attributes of the tower portion of the listed heritage building at 50-60 Fife Road be retained and that partial demolition of the balance of the building be approved.
 2. That the property at 50-60 Fife Road be retained on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties with a revision of the property description limited to the heritage attributes of the tower portion of the building.
 3. That the City Clerk be authorized to publish and serve notice of intention to designate the heritage attributes of the tower portion of the listed heritage building at 50-60 Fife Road pursuant to section 29, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.
 4. That the designation by-law for 50-60 Fife Road be brought before City Council for approval if no objections are received within the thirty (30) day objection period.
-

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

The purpose of this report is to recommend that Council publish its intention to designate the heritage attributes of the tower portion of the listed heritage building at 50-60 Fife Road according to provisions of section 29, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as described in the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and heritage attributes included in this report.

Staff recommendations in this report are in response to a recent application of Intention to Demolish a Cultural Heritage Resource. The designation of 50-60 Fife Road is intended to protect as much of the tower as is feasible as a distinct and significant vestige of the building's cultural heritage value.

Key Findings

A property may be designated under section 29, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets one or more of the three criteria used to determine cultural heritage value or interest as set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06.

The subject property is listed as non-designated on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties and is subject to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The tower portion of the building is the significant architectural feature of the listed built heritage resource which meets two of the three criteria used to determine cultural heritage value or interest as set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06 under the Ontario Heritage Act. Therefore, that part of the property merits individual heritage designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Staff recommend that the proponent retain the tower element of the F. J. Chadwick house through the proposed redevelopment of the subject property.

Staff advises City Council to retain the subject property on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties with a revision of the property description limited to the heritage attributes of the tower of the listed building. Staff also advise Council to consider publishing a Notice of Intention to Designate the heritage attributes on the property known as 50-60 Fife Road under section 29, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Financial Implications

The Planning Services budget covers the cost of a heritage designation plaque.

Report

A Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment (CHRIA) and Structural Assessment have been submitted in support of an application of Intention to Demolish a Cultural Heritage Resource for the existing listed heritage building at 50-60 Fife Road (Attachments 4 and 5). The proponent UpBuilding! Non-Profit Homes (Guelph) Inc. proposes to replace the existing building with two new buildings with 18 residential units.

As described in the CHRIA, the subject property is located on the south side of Fife Road west of Wellington Street. The building is listed as non-designated on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The heritage register record and current photos of the subject building are included in the attachments to this report.

The CHRIA provides an impressive account of the history of the subject property and has added substantially to what has been a very limited understanding of the cultural heritage value of the building.

Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Heritage Planning staff are of the opinion that the cultural heritage value of the listed built heritage resource at 50-60 Fife Road is found in the tower portion of the building. This extant element of the building has direct associations with Frederick Jasper Chadwick, a notable figure in the history of the city of Guelph. F. J. Chadwick (1838-1891) was a Provincial Land Surveyor, a prominent Guelph businessman, and proprietor of the Herald newspaper. Chadwick served on County and Town councils and was elected Mayor of Guelph in 1877. Chadwick enlarged the former Jackson residence in the 1860s using buff brick and stone trim and included a round plan, 3-storey tower. Chadwick consolidated his family's land

holdings on the south side of Fife Road and operated the property as Rock Maple Farm.

Heritage Planning staff are not of the opinion that there is significant physical cultural heritage value in the portion of the building that was the Richard Jackson residence (as it no longer exists) or in the 2-storey, brick addition built in 1903 by Mary-Ellen Watson and used as a pickle factory.

Staff are not supportive of the loss of the corner tower of the former F. J. Chadwick residence. The tower portion of the building has design value and physical value being architecturally distinctive and a rare extant example of mid-Victorian rural residential design that was built for a prominent figure in the history of the city of Guelph. Although the subsequent rendering or covering of the tower exterior with stucco significantly compromised the appearance and integrity of the original brick and stone walls. It would be difficult and costly to remove the stucco but this cladding does not completely negate the cultural heritage value of the tower as it is still very much a recognizable heritage character-defining element that is visible from Fife Road.

Staff are recommending to Council that the identified heritage attributes of the tower portion of the listed heritage building at 50-60 Fife Road be retained and that partial demolition of the balance of the building be approved.

The heritage attributes of the tower are as follows:

- Conical roof with a flat top
- Slate shingles with square and hexagonal shape
- Wooden corbels supporting the tower roof soffit

Financial Implications

The Planning Services budget covers the cost of a heritage designation plaque.

Consultations

Heritage Guelph has been consulted regarding Planning staff's intended recommendations to Council and the committee passed the following motions at their meeting of June 23, 2022.

THAT the tower portion of the listed heritage building at 50-60 Fife Road be retained and that partial demolition of the balance of the building be approved.

THAT the property at 50-60 Fife Road be retained on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties with a revision of the property description limited to the tower portion of the building.

THAT the City Clerk be authorized to publish and serve notice of intention to designate the tower portion of the listed heritage building at 50-60 Fife Road pursuant to section 29, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

THAT Heritage Guelph receive the Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment by Megan Hobson (dated April 16, 2022) and the Structural Assessment by Tacoma Engineers (dated June 9, 2022) submitted in support of the proposed demolition of the listed built heritage resource at 50-60 Fife Road.

Strategic Plan Alignment

Priority

Building our Future

Direction

Continue to build strong, vibrant, safe and healthy communities that foster resilience in the people who live here

Alignment

The conservation of cultural heritage resources is aligned with building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities

Attachments

Attachment-1 Location and Survey of Subject Property

Attachment-2 Historical Images and Record from the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties

Attachment-3 Current Photos

Attachment-4 CHRIA 50-60 Fife Road (Megan Hobson)

Attachment-5 Structural Assessment - 60 Fife Road (Tacoma Engineers)

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate, RPP, Manager, Policy Planning

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, Senior Heritage Planner

This report was approved by:

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP

General Manager, Planning and Building Services

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-837-5615, extension 2395

krista.walkey@guelph.ca

This report was recommended by:

Jayne Holmes, P.Eng., PMP

Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-822-1260 extension 2248

jayne.holmes@guelph.ca