

# **Attachment 7: Parking Standards Review and Zoning Bylaw Recommendations**

## **1. Purpose**

Council directed that staff consider the following motions for parking regulations in the Comprehensive Zoning Bylaw at the July 13, 2022, statutory public meeting:

1. That staff give consideration in the final recommendation report of the comprehensive zoning by-law that would remove the PA (Parking Adjustment) in the strategic growth areas on Gordon Street from Stone Road to Vaughan Street and consider leaving the parking ratio as is.
2. That staff give consideration in the final recommendation report of the comprehensive zoning bylaw to Part C, Table 5.2 to provide the same amount of visitor parking for lots identified with parking adjustment (PA) suffix as they do for those without parking adjustment (PA) suffix in Row 2: apartment building, Row 11: mixed use building.
3. That staff give consideration to conducting an updated off-street parking study for multiple residential with larger developments.

In addition to Council comments, a delegate at the statutory public meeting stated the following concerns:

- Highlighted the need for increased accessible parking as the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA) standards are not enough
- They also commented that there is a need for increased accessible parking as the disabled population far outweighs the minimums
- It was noted that the City's local transit and cycling infrastructure is not there yet, and
- That transit is not accessible to all types of disabilities and people need to see specialists in other cities.

The purpose of this review is to provide background information, Provincial and City policy, comparison of other municipal practices, and results of the 2023 off-street parking demand surveys for multi-unit residential buildings. This work updates and supplements the data collected in 2019 for the Guelph Parking Standards Discussion Paper and responds to comments raised at the Statutory Public Meeting.

## **2. Background**

In 2019, the City retained IBI Group to conduct an independent, data based review of parking standards and make preliminary recommendations for the Comprehensive Zoning Bylaw Review. Parking recommendations and rationale are summarized in the [Guelph Parking Standards Review Discussion Paper, 2019](#).

IBI Group conducted the following work as part of their review:

- A review of Guelph’s existing parking, loading, and driveway standards, and a review of the current land use planning policy framework as it relates to parking;
- An off-street parking demand review, which included parking utilization surveys of 20 properties throughout the city, including office, medical office, commercial and apartment uses;
- A review and assessment of zoning trends from other municipalities who have recently undergone reviews of their zoning bylaws and municipal parking standards; and,
- A review of the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) standards.

Based on these findings, IBI Group recommended a geographic-based approach to parking for the city which recognizes that parking needs vary throughout the community and parking requirements should reflect this. A parking adjustment area was recommended in the City’s nodes and intensification corridors, which recognizes their planned function as mixed-use walkable communities, located on transit routes. The parking adjustment areas are proposed to generally require less parking and applies a maximum parking rate. A maximum parking rate is recommended to ensure land is used efficiently within intensification areas and to ensure an oversupply of parking is not provided. This will also support transit use and active transportation in these areas.

The results of the off-street parking demand review found that observed peak parking demand rates typically fell below the minimum rates outlined in the 1995 Zoning Bylaw, supporting adoption of reduced parking rates for some land uses. In consideration of the survey data, zoning trends for minimum parking rates and the City’s Official Plan goals and policies, IBI Group generally recommended that minimum parking rates be reduced in a new zoning bylaw. In some cases, the required parking was not changed but clarity was added to the number of spaces required for visitor parking.

This recommended approach has been incorporated into the draft Zoning Bylaw, released in July 2022.

### **3. Policy Review**

#### **Planning Act**

The Planning Act (“the Act”) is provincial legislation that sets out the rules for planning matters in Ontario. Section 34 of the Planning Act sets out the powers of municipalities to pass zoning bylaws to regulate matters including the use of land (e.g. residential, commercial, industrial), and standards associated with land uses such as location, size, setback and parking requirements.

#### **Provincial Policy Statement, 2020**

The Provincial Policy Statement (PPS), provides province-wide policy direction

related to land use planning and development to foster strong, sustainable communities, a competitive economy and a clean, healthy environment. The PPS sets out that efficient development patterns optimize the use of land, resources and public investment in infrastructure and public service facilities. The PPS supports communities that enhance human health, social wellbeing and resiliency to climate change. The PPS is comprised of policies that promote land use patterns, density and mix of uses, minimization of length and number of vehicle trips and support current and future use of transit and active transportation (section 1.6.7).

### **A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe, Office Consolidation, 2020**

A Place to Grow: Growth Plan for the Greater Golden Horseshoe (the “Growth Plan”) provides a strategic framework for managing growth and land use development in the Greater Golden Horseshoe region, of which City of Guelph is part of. The Growth Plan supports the achievement of complete communities, a strong economic sector, social equity and a clean and healthy environment.

The Growth Plan provides policy direction for single-tier municipalities to develop policies that identify actions to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and address climate change adaptation goals in their official plans. Policies include reducing dependence on the automobile and supporting existing and planned transit and active transportation (section 4.2.10).

### **City of Guelph Official Plan, Office Consolidation 2022**

The City of Guelph’s Official Plan establishes the strategic goals, objectives and policies to manage future land use patterns. The Official Plan promotes community sustainability, environmental integrity, social wellbeing, economic vitality and energy sustainability. The following policies outline parking requirements for the City:

Section 5.11.2 - The City shall specify off-street parking requirements and may establish maximum parking requirements in the Zoning Bylaw, where appropriate.

Section 5.11.6 - Reduced parking requirements may be considered as part of a Parking Study, particularly within Downtown, Community Mixed-use Nodes and Intensification Corridors, or for affordable housing, or where high levels of transit exist or are planned.

Section 5.11.8 - The City may encourage managing the supply of parking as a transportation demand management (TDM) measure.

Section 7.2.4 - City Council may establish alternative development standards for affordable housing, residential intensification, redevelopment and new residential development which minimizes the cost of housing and facilitates compact urban form. This may include setting maximum unit sizes or reducing parking requirements.

## **Urban Design Policies**

The Official Plan's urban design policies establish well-functioning, attractive and valued spaces within the city. Urban Design policies assist in the achievement of complete communities, well-designed infrastructure networks and as such, apply to all development within the city. Section 8 of the Official Plan encourages designing compact neighbourhoods that provide for a choice of mobility options, including walking, cycling, transit and driving. Urban design policies related to parking generally address the location of parking and design of parking areas including the provision of pedestrian walkways, screening, and landscaping.

## **City of Guelph Transportation Master Plan, May 2022**

Guelph's Transportation Master Plan ("the TMP") provides a long-term plan for movement in the city. The TMP directs how Guelph's transportation system will be built, establishing policies and programs to guide the delivery of services for the next 30 years. The TMP outlines policies tied to land use and parking such as:

- Updates to the Official Plan that strengthen the link between development and transportation services;
- Enhancing walkability and pedestrian accessibility in Guelph (section 2);
- Improved parking efficiency – the City will conduct a review of on-street and off-street parking to ensure the city-wide parking system is in alignment with the goals and objectives of the TMP (section 5.1.1);
- Specify off-street parking requirements and may establish maximum parking requirements in the Zoning Bylaw, where appropriate (section 5.1.6); and
- Continue to provide off-street parking areas and facilities through zoning and site plan requirements (section 5.1.7).

## **City of Guelph Energy and Climate Change Initiatives and Race to Zero**

The City of Guelph has committed to the United Nations Race to Zero campaign. This campaign rallies leadership and support for cities, businesses, regions and educational institutions to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions. Over 700 Canadian and international cities and regions have joined the Cities Race to Zero campaign, and the City of Guelph is a designated member based on our existing climate change mitigation initiatives. The Cities Race to Zero methodology proposes fair share interim targets to reduce community per capita and corporate per capita GHG emissions by 63 per cent from 2018 levels by 2030 and achieve net zero GHG emissions by 2050. The City has committed to integrating environmental stewardship into municipal operations and services, by:

- Supporting and encouraging walking, cycling, car-pooling, car-sharing and transit-use within Guelph; and
- Protecting Guelph's natural heritage system and urban forest.

In May 2019, Guelph City Council voted to "acknowledge a climate crisis". Though is it not a formal declaration of a climate emergency, it does acknowledge the severity of the changing climate and the importance of environmental sustainability for the city.

The June 10, 2022, Council Information Report- [Cities Race-to-Zero Four-Year Interim Targets](#), outlined that the Corporate GHG emissions contribute less than 3% of the total community GHG emissions and identified one role of the Corporation is to facilitate the reduction of community GHG emissions for the different sectors. Transportation makes up the largest community contributor of GHG emissions at 26%, followed by industrial buildings (24%), institutional/commercial buildings (24%), residential buildings (23%), and waste and wastewater (3%).

The City is responsible for developing plans and policies, as well as building, operating, and maintaining City infrastructure that supports the rest of the community. Through these responsibilities, the City can enable the broader community stakeholders to enact environmental stewardship and reduce community GHG emissions.

**Urban Forest Study Report**

In 2019, the City released the Urban Forest Study Report. The report was the first comprehensive tree canopy study for the City of Guelph. It provided a detailed picture of the City’s forest resource on both private and public lands. The report made several recommendations, one of which relates to parking:

- Recommendation #8 – identify and implement best practices in zoning that maximize quality growing space on public and private land.

Although the Zoning Bylaw cannot regulate the number of trees per lot, it can regulate landscaped open space and buffer strip requirements which provide landscaped areas and opportunities for trees to be planted. Furthermore, a reduction of required parking means less asphalt and additional space for landscaping and trees on a site.

**4. Existing Zoning By-law, (1995)-14864**

The City of Guelph’s current Zoning Bylaw has not been comprehensively reviewed since 1995 and does not align with current Official Plan policy and contemporary zoning practices. Existing parking provisions are embedded within the General Provisions section of the existing Zoning Bylaw.

Section 4.13.4 of the Zoning Bylaw establishes the City’s requirements for the number of parking spaces by land use. The existing Zoning Bylaw stipulates minimum parking requirements and does not contain maximum parking space requirements. The following summarizes parking requirements for residential apartment building and townhouse land uses.

**Table 1: Required Parking Spaces – Residential Uses**

Type of use or building	Minimum required parking spaces
-------------------------	---------------------------------

Apartment building	For the first 20 units: 1.5 per unit, for each unit in excess of 20: 1.25 per unit (except for in the R.4C zone, which requires 1 per unit)
Townhouse	1 per unit

Section 4.13.6 of the Zoning Bylaw establishes the requirement for the provision of visitor parking in certain residential zones (R.3A or R.4 zones). In these zones, in addition to the parking spaces required to satisfy the residential parking requirements, a minimum of 20% of the calculated total required number of parking spaces must be reserved for the use of visitors to a residential building. This section also provides that visitor parking spaces shall be provided above grade and be demarcated for visitor parking use.

**Accessibility Parking**

Section 4.13.5 of the Zoning Bylaw establishes accessible parking rates, and provides that “in any commercial, institutional, industrial, park or residential R.3A and R.4 zones, where more than 25 parking spaces are required by section 4.13.4, the required number of parking spaces shall include the provision of designated accessible parking spaces for the use of physically disabled persons.” The current accessible parking standards (both dimensions and rate requirements) do not conform to the existing requirements of the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA). The following table summarizes the current accessible parking rate requirements.

**Table 2: Required Parking Spaces – Accessibility**

Total required parking spaces	Number of required designated accessible parking spaces
2 -50	1
51 - 200	2
201 - 300	3
301 -400	4
400+	4 spaces plus 1 additional accessible space per 100 required spaces

**5. [Guelph Parking Standards Review, Discussion Paper, 2019](#)**

In 2019, IBI Group was retained to provide recommendations for updates to the parking regulations set out in the 1995 Zoning Bylaw. The recommended rates for apartment buildings and cluster, stacked and back-to-back townhouses are as follows:

**Recommended parking rates for apartment buildings:**

- Recommended to be slightly lowered and clarity added to visitor parking requirement

- Each of the comparator municipalities examined in the inter-jurisdictional review used a slightly different formula to calculate parking rates for apartments. The majority of these formulas produce lower parking space requirements than that which is currently required in the City of Guelph
- Maximum parking rates should be considered for apartment buildings within the City’s planned intensification corridors and community mixed use nodes to support land use planning objectives

**Table 3: Comparison of Parking Rates for Apartment Buildings**

<b>Existing rate (min)</b>	<b>Observed rate</b>	<b>Proposed rate (min)</b>	<b>Proposed parking adjustment (PA) area</b>
1.5 space per unit for the first 20 units and 1.25 space per unit thereafter. 20% of calculated total is required visitor parking.	0.8 spaces per unit (including visitor parking)	<p>If total dwelling unit count is less than 20 units: 1 space per dwelling unit, plus 0.25 visitor spaces per dwelling unit.</p> <p>If development contains 20 dwelling units or greater: 1 space per dwelling unit, plus 0.15 visitor spaces per dwelling unit</p>	1 space per dwelling unit, plus 0.1 visitor spaces per dwelling unit

**Recommended parking rates for cluster, stacked, and back-to-back townhouses:**

- No recommended change in parking rate from the existing Zoning Bylaw
- No recommended reduction in parking rate for lands within the parking adjustment (PA) area
- As part of the parking demand survey work undertaken in Phase 1 of this study, four townhouse developments were reviewed and demonstrated that at these sites, residential and visitor parking demand was closely aligned with existing Zoning Bylaw requirement
- Clarification should be added for visitor parking space requirements

**Table 4: Comparison of Parking Rates for Cluster, Stacked, and Back-to-Back Townhouses**

<b>Existing rate (min)</b>	<b>Observed rate</b>	<b>Proposed rate (min)</b>	<b>Proposed parking adjustment (PA) area</b>
1.2 space per unit (includes visitor parking)	1 space per unit includes visitor parking	1 space per dwelling unit, plus 0.2 visitor spaces per dwelling unit	Same as proposed rate for the rest of the city

**Recommended accessible parking standards:**

- The existing 1995 Zoning Bylaw parking standards (both dimensions and rate requirements) do not conform to the existing requirements of the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA)
- Update accessible parking standards to align with the Integrated Accessibilities Standard (O. Reg. 191/11 of the AODA) identifies the minimum amount of accessible parking spaces which must be provided by organizations for the use of persons with disabilities

**6. Parking Utilization Survey, 2022**

In November 2022, BA Group was retained to initiate an independent off-street parking demand review of 15 multi-residential sites within the Gordon Street Intensification Corridor (as identified in Schedule 1 of the Guelph Official Plan), and previously surveyed residential developments within the city. This study was requested by Council as part of the July 13, 2022, statutory public meeting. Please refer to BA Group’s final report attached to this paper for complete study data and BA Group’s recommendations.

The following **resident parking** demand study results for apartment buildings and cluster and stacked townhouses and key findings are outlined below.

**Apartment buildings:**

- Median resident parking demand for apartment buildings was observed in the 0.55-0.95 spaces per unit range
- Median resident parking utilization was in the 60-80% range for each site
- Peak resident parking demand for apartment buildings was observed in the 0.70-0.95 spaces per unit range
- Peak resident parking utilization was in the 60-90% range for each site

**Cluster and stacked townhouses:**

- Median resident parking demand for cluster and stacked townhouses was observed in the 0.65-1.00 spaces per unit range



- Median resident parking utilization was in the 60-70% range for each site
- Peak resident parking demand for cluster and stacked townhouses was observed in the 0.85-1.25 spaces per unit range
- Peak resident parking utilization was in the 75-90% range for each site

The following residential **visitor parking** demand study results for apartment buildings and cluster and stacked townhouses and key findings are outlined below:

**Apartment buildings:**

- Median visitor parking demand for apartment buildings was observed in the 0.00-0.18 spaces per unit range
- Median visitor parking utilization was in the 0-100% range for each site
- Peak visitor parking demand for apartment buildings was observed in the 0.00-0.23 spaces per unit range
- Peak visitor parking utilization was in the 0-100% range for each site
- 1280-1284 Gordon Street was an outlier in the study; the highest peak visitor parking demand aside from that site was 0.11 spaces per unit

**Cluster and stacked townhouses:**

- Median visitor parking demand for cluster and stacked townhouses was observed in the 0.10-0.21 spaces per unit range
- Median visitor parking utilization (i.e. demand divided by supply) was in the 65-100% range for each site
- Peak visitor parking demand for cluster and stacked townhouses was observed in the 0.10-0.24 spaces per unit range
- Peak visitor parking utilization was in the 75-100% range at three of four sites
- 454 Janefield Avenue and 803 Gordon Street were near visitor parking capacity throughout the study, both sites have provided less than the 0.2 visitor parking spaces that are required by the Zoning Bylaw

The results indicate that resident parking demand does not appear to be constrained by parking supply at any site. At townhouse sites, peak parking demand was observed at 78-90% of available parking supply across surveyed sites, and at apartment sites, peak parking demand was observed at 66-90% of available parking supply across surveyed sites. The average peak parking demand in the Gordon Street intensification corridor is 0.76 spaces per unit for residents in apartments, and in the Gordon/Clair Community Mixed-Use Node is 0.85 spaces per unit for residents in apartments.

These measures reflect, generally, a minor oversupply of parking at most surveyed sites. Given that all the surveyed sites were approved and constructed prior to the current Zoning Bylaw review exercise which proposes to reduce minimum resident parking requirements, the data indicates that the reductions are appropriate.

Conversely, residential visitor parking demand reached capacity at some survey sites and therefore, was likely constrained by parking supply. At other sites, no residential visitor parking demand was observed at all.

Based on the results of the 2022 parking utilization study, BA Group recommends further reducing the minimum parking requirement for residents in apartment buildings within the parking adjustment (PA) area to 0.85 spaces per unit (from 1 space per unit). They also recommended that consideration be given to reducing the corresponding maximum parking requirement for residents in apartment buildings within the PA area, although a specific maximum rate has not been recommended.

## **7. Staff Recommendations**

### **1. Staff are not recommending changes to the proposed parking rates within the parking adjustment (PA) area within the Gordon Street intensification corridor (Gordon Street from Stone Road to Vaughan Street).**

#### **Rationale:**

- Alignment with results of both the IBI Group (2019) and BA Group (2022) parking utilization studies and recommendations
- Data collected does not warrant the removal of the parking adjustment (PA) parking rates within the Gordon Street intensification corridor
- Staff are not recommending a reduced parking rate as recommended by BA Group. This is a conservative approach that aligns with the parking requirements of the parking adjustment (PA) areas city-wide.
- To support reduced parking where high levels of transit exist or are planned (along Gordon Street)
- To support and encourage walking, cycling, car-pooling, car-sharing and transit-use within the city and protect Guelph's urban tree canopy, as committed through Race to Zero and policies of the Transportation Master Plan
- To support redevelopment of lands within designated intensification areas into mixed-use communities. Without a reduction in parking, it will be more difficult for developments to meet residential housing targets.

### **2. Staff are not recommending increasing the proposed visitor parking rates for apartment and mixed-use buildings within the parking adjustment (PA) area.**

#### **Rationale:**

- Alignment with results of both the IBI Group (2019) and BA Group (2022) parking utilization studies and recommendations
- Data collected does not justify an increase in visitor parking

- There was one outlier site in the study and the highest peak visitor parking demand aside from that site was 0.11 spaces per unit at the peak time. All other sites had a visitor parking demand rate that was at or below 0.10 spaces per unit.
- To support reduced parking in mixed-use communities where high levels of transit exist or are planned
- To support and encourage walking, cycling, car-pooling, car-sharing and transit-use within the city and protect Guelph's urban tree canopy, as committed through Race to Zero and policies of the Transportation Master Plan

**3. Accessible parking rates were updated to meet AODA requirements. Further revisions have been made to the draft Zoning Bylaw to ensure that accessible parking space requirements are not reduced within the parking adjustment (PA) areas of the city, meaning the number of accessible parking spaces required for development is consistent across the city.**

- Alignment with Provincial AODA legislation
- Alignment with other municipal Zoning Bylaw practices
- Data collected through the parking utilization surveys do not indicate a constraint in the amount of accessible parking spaces provided (number of spaces provided are based on 1995 accessible parking rates. See Appendix A in the 2019 [Guelph Parking Standards Review Discussion Paper](#) (commercial and residential sites) and Appendix B in the 2022 Multi-Unit Residential Parking Demand Study (residential sites) attached to this paper.

**8. Council directed alternative regulations- not supported by Staff**

As per Council direction provided at the statutory public meeting on July 13, 2022, Staff have provided the following zoning bylaw wording, however do not recommend these provisions.

- 1. That the parking adjustment (PA) area along the Gordon Street, from Stone Road to Vaughan Street be removed from the Comprehensive Zoning Bylaw.**
- 2. That Table 5.2, Row 2, be amended to "If total dwelling unit count is less than 20 dwelling units: 1 space per dwelling unit, plus 0.25 visitor spaces per dwelling unit. If total dwelling unit count is 20 dwelling units or greater: 1 space per dwelling unit, plus 0.15 visitor spaces per dwelling unit" as the minimum required within the parking adjustment (PA) area.**

- 3. That Table 5.2, Row 12, be amended to “In addition to the non-residential parking rate, 1 space per dwelling unit plus 0.15 visitor parking spaces per dwelling unit” as the minimum required within the parking adjustment (PA) area.**