

Staff Report



| | |
|--------------|---|
| To | City Council |
| Service Area | Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services |
| Date | Tuesday, June 13, 2023 |
| Subject | 20 Cityview Drive North: Removal from Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties and Notice of Intention to Demolish |

Recommendation

1. That the property known as 20 Cityview Drive North be removed from the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties; and
 2. That the demolition of the barn building at 20 Cityview Drive North be approved.
-

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

To provide Council with information and staff's recommendation about the proposed removal from the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties and notice of intention to demolish a barn building located at 20 Cityview Drive North.

Key Findings

An application of Intention to Demolish the barn at 20 Cityview Drive North has been received from Carson Reid Homes as part of their current Draft Plan of Subdivision application (23T-12502) for the surrounding lands at 20 and 37 Cityview Drive North. The application for Draft Plan of Subdivision was deemed complete in April 2012.

The barn is listed as a non-designated built heritage resource on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties.

Heritage Planning staff and the Heritage Guelph advisory committee concur with the findings of the Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment (CHRIA) provided by MHBC in that the subject barn building does not have sufficient cultural heritage value to merit protection under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Strategic Plan Alignment

The key findings and recommendations of this report align with Strategic Plan priorities areas. The removal of 20 Cityview Drive North does not detract from the City's priority of Building our Future. The following report explains how the barn at 20 Cityview Drive North is not considered a significant built heritage resource. By choosing to conserve significant built heritage resources the City moves in a

direction that continues to build strong, vibrant, safe and healthy communities that foster resilience in the people who live here. The conservation of cultural heritage resources is aligned with building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities.

Financial Implications

None.

Report

The subject property is located on west side of Cityview Drive North, north of the Goderich-Exeter Railway tracks and south of the current termination of Henry Court (Attachment-1).

In 2022, Carson Reid Homes submitted an application of Intention to Demolish the barn at 20 Cityview Drive North. The application was deemed complete on March 30, 2023. According to Section 27 (9) of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, when the municipality has issued receipt of a complete application Council has 60 days to consult with Heritage Guelph and make a decision whether to protect the property under the provisions of the Act.

The barn is listed as a non-designated built heritage resource on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties. For the application to be deemed complete, a CHRIA report was required to be received by Heritage Planning staff. The CHRIA was brought before the Heritage Guelph advisory committee at their meeting of April 11, 2023 for their comments regarding the application to remove the barn from the heritage register and to demolish the barn.

20 Cityview Drive North is part of a current application by Carson Reid Homes for the Cityview Ridge Draft Plan of Subdivision (23T-12502) at 20 and 37 Cityview Drive North (Attachment-2) involving the division of the subject lands into a number of smaller parcels to be redeveloped for a mixture of single-detached dwellings, semi-detached dwellings, and townhouse dwellings. The existing buildings and structures on the property (barn, shed, and dwelling) are proposed to be removed as part of the proposed development.

There are three buildings on the subject property but only the barn (Attachment-3, Figures 1 and 2) has heritage status as it is listed as non-designated heritage on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties. The barn was also identified in the City's Cultural Heritage Action Plan process, along with thirteen other extant farm barns in the City of Guelph. The record for the barn in the heritage register does not indicate a date of construction but Heritage Planning staff are of the opinion that the poured concrete and concrete block ground floor walls and the modern upper floor wall and roof framing members indicate that the barn was likely re-built in the mid-20th century using material salvaged from previous buildings. The poured concrete walls containing the ends of what appear to be salvaged heavy timber beams for the upper floor joists lead staff to the conclusion that the barn is not of significant age or construction method.

Neither the small shed nor the existing dwelling on the property have heritage status as they have not been listed on the City's heritage register. As the property is now subject to a Draft Plan of Subdivision as a prescribed event under the

Ontario Heritage Act, there is no legislative authority to consider protection of the dwelling or shed with the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The small shed (Attachment-3, Figure 4) near the barn has the same corrugated metal exterior cladding as the barn and has interior framing that also appears to have been constructed in the mid-20th century.

The existing dwelling (Attachment-3, Figures 5 and 6) is likely much older than the barn and shed. The physical integrity of the dwelling is low as it has only retained the shell of its basic 1.5-storey form and has undergone significant and unsympathetic alterations including the removal of all original windows, doors, and wood trim, and the replacement of the front and rear porches.

Heritage Planning staff concur with the findings of the Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment provided by MHBC on behalf of the property owner. The listed barn building at 20 Cityview Drive North does not meet the criteria for designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The barn on the subject property has no design value or physical value as it is not a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method. It does not display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, nor does it demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

The property is broadly associated with the early agricultural settlement of Guelph Township and the Power family, an early European settler to the area, but as the subject barn itself was built in the mid-20th century it has no historical value or associative value because it has no direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to the Guelph community. The property does not yield, or have the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of the Guelph community or culture. The barn does not demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the Guelph community.

The barn has no contextual value as it is not important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area nor is it physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings. The barn is not a landmark.

Staff have no objection to the removal of the property known as 20 Cityview Drive North from the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties.

Financial Implications

None.

Consultations

At their meeting of April 11, 2023 the Heritage Guelph advisory committee carried the following motion:

That Heritage Guelph advises City Council that they have no objection to the removal of the property known as 20 Cityview Drive North from the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties.

Attachments

Attachment-1 Property Location

Attachment-2 Draft Plan of Subdivision

Attachment-3 Current Photographs

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate, MCIP, RPP Manager of Policy Planning

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, MA, CAHP Senior Heritage Planner

This report was approved by:

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP

General Manager, Planning and Building Services

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-822-1260 extension 2395

krista.walkey@guelph.ca

This report was recommended by:

Jayne Holmes, P. Eng., PMP

Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services

519-822-1260 extension 2248

jayne.holmes@guelph.ca