

Advisory Committee of Council Staff Report



To Heritage Guelph
Date Monday, September 11, 2023
Subject **49 Metcalfe Street: Heritage Attributes and Designation Recommendation**

Recommendation

1. That Heritage Guelph supports the heritage attributes identified for 49 Metcalfe Street as outlined in the staff report dated September 11, 2023; and
 2. THAT Heritage Guelph recommends that City Council give notice of its intention to designate 49 Metcalfe Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act
-

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

The Dario Pagani House at 49 Metcalfe Street is listed as a non-designated built heritage resource on the City of Guelph's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under Part IV, Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act. This report recommends that 49 Metcalfe Street meets five of the prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, in accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06 (as amended by O Reg. 569/22) made under the Ontario Heritage Act. This staff report provides a draft list of heritage attributes and staff's recommendation that City Council give notice of its intention to designate 49 Metcalfe Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Strategic Plan Alignment

The recommendations of this report support the Strategic Theme of City Building. Conservation of cultural heritage resources in the City of Guelph is aligned with improving housing supply by building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities.

Report

Location

The subject property is located at 49 Metcalfe Street, on the northeast corner of Metcalfe Street and Parkholm Avenue. The legal description is PLAN 357 LOT 26 PT LOT 24.

Statement of Significance

The subject property is worthy of designation under section 29, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act because it meets five of the prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, according to Ontario Regulation 9/06 as amended by 569/22. The heritage attributes of 49 Metcalfe Street display: design or physical, historical or associative, and contextual value.

Design/Physical Value

The subject property meets Criterion 1 because it exhibits design and physical value as a rare example of the Art Moderne style architecture in the City of Guelph. The Dario Pagani house is the first Art Moderne residence constructed in the city and remains Guelph's only example of Art Moderne residential architecture.

The subject property meets Criterion 2 because it displays a high degree of artistic merit. Inspired by aerodynamic design, the Art Moderne style emphasized streamlined, curving forms, and long horizontal lines. The Pagani house includes features typical of the Art Moderne, with smooth, rounded stucco walls, a flat roof with a small ledge at roofline, an asymmetrical façade, corner sash window groupings, and metal balustrades.

Historical/Associative Value

The subject property meets Criterion 4 because it has direct associations with Dario Pagani, an Italian immigrant that became one of Guelph's most significant mid-century building contractors, and Dario's son, Richard Pagani, who was raised at 49 Metcalfe and would become a provincially significant architect.

The subject property meets Criterion 5 because it yields information that contributes to an understanding of the Italian immigrant experience in the first half of the twentieth century. When the Dario Pagani House was constructed, St. George's neighborhood was occupied primarily by Canadians of Anglo-Celtic descent. The Dario Pagani house represents the social and economic mobility of working-class Italian immigrants in mid-twentieth century Guelph.

Contextual Value

The subject property meets Criterion 9 because it is a landmark. The property stands out amongst the predominantly brown, yellow, and redbrick revival style residences that ring St. George's Park on Metcalfe, Grange, and Palmer streets. The stark white stucco walls, situation on a corner lot, prominent visual location across from St George's Park, and unique Art Modern architectural style make the residence a landmark in the neighborhood.

Heritage Attributes

The following elements of the property at 49 Metcalfe Street should be considered as heritage attributes in a designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act:

- The building form, including
 - Flat roof
 - Curved exterior wall
- Window and door openings including:
 - Stepped 3-unit window on the curved wall

- Wrap-around corner window
- Front door with porthole window
- Extant original window sashes
- Extant original exterior doors
- Poured concrete walls
- Metal balustrade and balcony support
- Stucco cladding
- Protruding attached garage

It is intended that non-original features may be returned to the documented earlier designs or to their documented original without requiring City Council permission for an alteration to the design.

Staff Recommendation

Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property and determined that the Dario Pagani House at 49 Metcalfe Street meets five of the prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, according to Ontario Regulation 569/22. Staff recommend that the property should be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Consultations

Heritage staff have reached out to the property owners by mail but have not received a response as of the writing of this report.

Heritage staff have been in contact with the Pagani family, including Dario's daughter-in-law, Yvonne Pagani, and his granddaughter, Cathy Pagani, who provided additional research. Both Cathy and Yvonne support the designation of 49 Metcalfe Street.

On July 10, 2023, Heritage Guelph passed the following motion:

THAT the comments provided by Heritage Guelph members on the '49 Metcalfe Street: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report' be provided to staff and Council for their consideration.

Attachments

Attachment-1 Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report

Attachment-2 Historic Documents and Maps

Attachment-3 Current Photographs

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate Manager, Policy Planning and Urban Design, City of Guelph

Report Author

Jack Mallon, Heritage Planner, Policy Planning and Urban Design, City of Guelph