

Advisory Committee of Council Staff Report



To Heritage Guelph
Date Tuesday, October 10, 2023
Subject **331 Clair Road East: Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment**

Recommendation

1. THAT the comments provided by Heritage Guelph on “331 Clair Road East: Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment” (prepared by MHBC and dated May 2023) be provided to staff and Council for their consideration
-

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

To provide Heritage Guelph with Staff’s assessment of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (Attachment 1), prepared by MHBC and dated May 2023, submitted as part of the complete application for a Zoning By-law Amendment (ZBA) for the subject property municipally known as 331 Clair Road East.

Report

Location

The subject property is located on the south side of Clair Road East at Tolton Drive, west of Victoria Road South.

Background

An application for a Zoning By-law Amendment (ZBA) has been received for the lands municipally known as 331 Clair Road East from MHBC Planning on behalf of the owner 2488995 Ontario Ltd. (Reid’s Heritage Homes partnership), to rezone the subject lands from “Agricultural” (A-2) under the Township of Puslinch Zoning By-law 19/85 to “Specialized Residential Townhouse” (R.3A-XX) under City of Guelph Zoning By-law (1995)-14864 as amended, and from “Urban Reserve 1” (UR.1) to “Specialized Medium Density Residential 6” (RM.6-XX) under City of Guelph Zoning By-law (2023)-20790, to permit the development of 8 stacked townhouse blocks comprising of 136 units.

The City of Guelph received an HIA Amendment, prepared by MHBC, as part of a ZBA application deemed complete on September 18, 2023. A ZBA constitutes a prescribed event according to the Ontario Heritage Act. Section 29 (1.2.2), Part IV, of the Ontario Heritage Act outlines that a municipality has 90 days to issue a Notice of Intention to Designate a property following a prescribed event.

Heritage Status of Buildings on the property

The stone dwelling at 331 Clair Road East, known as the James Hanlon farmhouse, is listed as a non-designated built heritage resource on the City of Guelph's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under Part IV, Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act. A [Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report](#) was presented to Heritage Guelph at their [June 12, 2023](#) meeting that recommended that the property met four of the [Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest](#).

There are two detached accessory structures on the subject property (see Attachment 2, Figures 9 & 10). Neither structure is listed in the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties and staff are of the opinion that neither structure has any cultural heritage value or interest.

Description of Proposed Development

The current development proposal includes the construction of eight stacked townhouse blocks with a total of 136 units, with parking spaces located in the centre of the site around an amenity area. Included in this proposal is the relocation of the house to the northeast of the property to be adaptively re-used as an amenity space. It is proposed that the summer kitchen and original foundation will be removed from the main house.

Alternatives, Mitigation and Conservation

The HIA explores alternative development approaches in addition to the proposed approach to relocate the dwelling on the property. Alternatives explored include "do nothing approach," "develop the site and leave the dwelling in situ," "develop the site and retain portions of the dwelling," and "relocation to an alternative site."

Mitigation and conservation are discussed with respect to the relocation and new foundation. The report recommends a conservation plan, documentation and salvage, commemoration and designation.

Staff Comments

Staff have reviewed the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment, prepared by MHBC and dated May, 2023 and have the following comments:

- Though heritage staff confirmed that the windows have been destroyed, the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment should include images of the windows to confirm this observation (page 20)
- While heritage staff are supportive of the relocation of the stone farmhouse, the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment should provide further detail on how the relocation of the James Hanlon farmhouse is a neutral impact, with reference to the Province of Ontario's [Eight Guiding Principles for the Conservation of Built Heritage Properties](#). Specifically, the second principle: Respect for original location (page 24).
- Heritage staff agree with the list of Heritage Attributes identified in the report (page 18)

Staff are in agreement with the recommendations of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment. Though removal of the summer kitchen and original foundation of the farmhouse will adversely impact its heritage value, the most significant heritage attributes of the structure will be retained. While relocation can adversely impact

built heritage resources, staff are of the opinion the farmhouse's relocation elsewhere on the Hanlon property will minimally impact the property's heritage value. Its prominent location in the new development will ensure its connection to the Clair Road East streetscape and anchor the new development in the property's history. Adaptive re-use of the farmhouse as an amenity space will ensure the structure's conservation into the future.

Attachments

Attachment-1 Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment (MHBC, 2023)

Attachment-2 Current Exterior Photographs

Attachment-3 Current Interior Photographs

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate
Manager, Policy Planning and Urban Design

Report Author

Jack Mallon
Heritage Planner 1, Policy Planning and Urban Design