Advisory Committee of Council Staff Report



To Heritage Guelph

Date Monday, November 13, 2023

Subject **220 Gordon Street: Heritage Attributes and**

Designation Recommendation

Recommendation

1. That Heritage Guelph supports the heritage attributes identified for 220 Gordon Street as outlined in the staff report dated November 13, 2023; and

 That Heritage Guelph recommends that City Council give notice of its intention to designate 220 Gordon Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

The stone building at 220 Gordon Street is listed as a non-designated built heritage resource on the City of Guelph's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under Part IV, Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act. This report recommends that the 2-storey, limestone portion of the building at 220 Gordon Street meets five of the nine prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, in accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06, as amended by Ontario Regulation 569/22, made under the Ontario Heritage Act. This report provides a draft list of heritage attributes and staff's recommendation that City Council give notice of its intention to designate the property at 220 Gordon Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Strategic Plan Alignment

The recommendations of this report support the Strategic Theme of City Building. Conservation of cultural heritage resources in the City of Guelph is aligned with improving housing supply by building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities.

Report

Location

The subject property is located on the southeast corner of Gordon Street at James Street East. The property is adjacent to the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District. The legal description of the property is Lots 1 and 2 of Benjamin Harrison's unregistered survey.

The real property includes the semi-detached dwellings at 9 and 11 James Street East and a detached, 3-car garage in southeast corner of subject property. These buildings are not listed on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties and

have no heritage status. For the purposes of this report, the subject property will be referred to generally as 220 Gordon Street.

Statement of Significance

The subject property is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act because it meets five of the nine prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, according to Ontario Regulation 9/06 as amended by 569/22. The heritage attributes of 220 Gordon Street display: design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual value.

Design/Physical Value

220 Gordon Street meets Criterion 1 having design or physical value as it is a representative example of limestone construction from the mid-19th century with an 1875 addition that has a corner entrance door in a rare, rounded, 2-storey limestone corner.

Historical/Associative Value

The subject property meets Criterion 4 because it has direct associations with a theme of historical mixed use involving local corner stores with housing above – a combination that was conventional in many of Guelph's residential neighbourhoods since the establishment of the Town and in some cases continuing into the first half of the 20th century.

Contextual Value

The subject property meets Criteria 7 because it is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the architectural character of the area. This segment of the Gordon Street streetscape is an important historic element adjacent to the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District.

The subject property meets Criteria 8 because the stone building is visually and historically linked to its surroundings. The 1875 limestone addition to the north expanded the commercial/residential uses and its architectural design is quite compatible with the materials and form of the original building. The close proximity of the corner store doors and flanking windows to the street gives it visual prominence at this intersection within the historic Gordon Street streetscape.

The subject property meets Criteria 9 because the building's distinctive form and and limestone construction have become a landmark within the historic Gordon Street and College Hill streetscape.

Heritage Attributes

The following elements of the property at 220 Gordon Street should be considered as heritage attributes in a designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act:

- 2-storey, limestone corner building form with a rounded corner in the roof and stone exterior of the northern portion of the building
- original limestone exterior facing Gordon Street, James Street East and the east elevation facing the parking area
- limestone parapet on west elevation marking the earlier north wall of the building

- original window and door openings in the stone exterior walls
- two large storefront windows flanking the corner entrance (currently filled in with granite)

It is intended that non-original features may be returned to the documented earlier designs or to their documented original without requiring City Council permission for an alteration to the design.

Staff Recommendation

Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property and have determined that the corner building at 220 Gordon Street meets five of the prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, according to Ontario Regulation 569/22. Staff recommend that the property should be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Consultations

On September 11, 2023, Heritage Guelph passed the following motion:

THAT the comments provided by Heritage Guelph members on the '220 Gordon Street: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report' be provided to staff and Council for their consideration.

Heritage Planning staff have reached out to the property owner by mail to inform them of the progress being made in the cultural heritage evaluation and proposed heritage attributes of their property. No response has been received from the owner as of the writing of this report.

Attachments

Attachment 1 - 220 Gordon Street: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report

Attachment 2 - Current Photos

Attachment 3 - Historical Images and Documents

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, Senior Heritage Planner