Staff Report

To	**City Council**
Service Area	Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
Date	Tuesday, October 17, 2023
Subject	**2187 Gordon Street: Notice of Intention to Designate**

Recommendation

1. That the City Clerk be authorized to publish and serve notice of intention to designate 2187 Gordon Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
2. That the designation bylaw be brought before Council for approval if no objections are received within the thirty (30) day objection period.

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

The purpose of this report is to recommend that Council publish its intention to designate 2187 Gordon Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The cultural heritage significance and heritage attributes of the property are described in this report.

Key Findings

The Kidd barn and the Blair farmhouse at 2187 Gordon Street are both listed as non-designated built heritage resources on the City of Guelph's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under Part IV, Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

A property may be protected by designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets at two or more of the criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest as prescribed by Ontario Regulation 9/06 (as amended by Ontario Regulation 569/22) under the Ontario Heritage Act (see Attachment-3).

Heritage planning staff, in consultation with Heritage Guelph, have completed a cultural heritage evaluation recommending that 2187 Gordon Street meets six of the prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, in accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06 (as amended by O Reg. 569/22) under the Ontario Heritage Act. Therefore, the property merits individual heritage designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

This staff report contains a recommended list of heritage attributes and staff's recommendation that Council give notice of its intention to designate 2187 Gordon Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Strategic Plan Alignment

The designation of 2187 Gordon Street under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act contributes to the City's Strategic Plan priority of Building our Future. By conserving significant built heritage resources, the City moves in a direction that continues to build strong, vibrant, safe and healthy communities that foster resilience to the people who live here. The conservation of cultural heritage resources is aligned with building and maintaining vibrant and resilient communities.

Financial Implications

There are no financial implications associated with this report.

Report

The property known municipally as 2187 Gordon Street is located on the west side of Gordon Street, north of Maltby Road, south of Clair Road West and east of the Hanlon Parkway (Attachment-1: Figure 1). The legal description of the property is Part Lot 14, Concession 7, designated as Part 1, Reference Plan 61R-21631, formerly Township of Puslinch, City of Guelph (Attachment-1: Figure 2).

The Kidd barn and the Blair farmhouse at 2187 Gordon Street are both listed as non-designated built heritage resources on the City of Guelph's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under Part IV, Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

The subject property is within the Clair-Maltby Secondary Plan area and identified in the Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment Existing Conditions Report (ASI: Dec 2016, revised June 2017) as containing the barn and farmhouse as built heritage resources. The 2017 report recommended these two buildings as strong candidates for conservation and integration into future land uses in the secondary plan area and that heritage designation should be considered as part of mitigation and/or alternative development approaches to reduce the potential for adverse impacts.

The Cultural Heritage Action Plan (CHAP) was approved by Council in January 2021. The CHAP provided a review and recommendations for the extant farm barns within the City of Guelph that have been listed on the City's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties. Listing a property on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties signals the importance of a cultural heritage resource to the City of Guelph and also requires notice from the owner should a building be proposed for demolition so that the property can be evaluated for potential heritage designation. Designation under the Ontario Heritage Act is the strongest means by which a municipality in Ontario can protect cultural heritage resources. The CHAP recommended the James Kidd barn at 2187 Gordon Street as a priority for individual designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Historical Background

Puslinch Township was surveyed by David Gibson in 1828-1831. Known as the "old survey", it included the 7th, 8th, 9th, and 10th concessions. The Dundas Road connecting Guelph to Dundas ran between the 7th and 8th concessions. James Beresford Kidd, one of the first settlers of Puslinch township, settled on Lot 14, Concession 7 in 1829. Initially the James Kidd property abutted Aboukir Road, the primary means of transportation between Dundas and Guelph (Attachment-2,

Figure 1). Aboukir Road was renamed Brock Road in 1848. James Kidd is identified in the 1833 Puslinch Township assessment and census list with 94 acres of land uncultivated and eight acres under cultivation. The lot was assessed at £38 and 16 pence. While there is no home indicated in the census, there are a variety of horses and livestock including oxen, milk cows and young cattle. The 1835 assessment notes that James was joined by his brother, Samuel Kidd, in settlement of the lot. The 1835 assessment assessed the lot at £54, which suggests the presence of barns, outbuildings or homes. The 1840 census identifies James and Samuel Kidd and notes that James had been in Ontario for eleven years and Samuel for eight. The 1840 census identifies Samuel as a mason by trade, suggesting that he may have constructed the stone slot barn. As land registry records attest, James finally earned the patent to his 100 acres in 1844. By 1846, James had sold the west half of the lot to Samuel Kidd.

The 1851 census sees the Kidd family enumerated as one family in one log house. The family includes James and his wife Lydia (both identified as 53 years old). The census also identifies 67-year-old Samuel as a widower as of February and his 28-year-old son Samuel Jr. in another log house. The 1861 Census indicates that James was remarried to another Lydia, who was listed as 30 years old while James is 62. It is confirmed in his obituary that James was twice married. Lydia "Liddy" Kidd (née Watling) ran the farm independently for 28 years after the death of James in 1878.

By 1871, the census indicates that the household contained eight individuals: James (aged 71), Lydia (39 years old), sons William, Isaac, and George (aged 8, 7 and 6 respectively) and three daughters: Louise, Sarah Ann and Jemima (aged 5, 2 and seven months respectively). According to the 1871 census, the Kidd family had 52 acres of land in total with one house, one barn or stable, two ploughs and a single fanning mill. Forty acres are considered improved with one acre in orchard. Crops include peas and beans, hops, hay, and apples. Farm products identified include 260lbs of butter, 70lbs of cheese and 50lbs of wool. Parts of the lot change hands in the mid-19th century, but the lot returns to the Kidd family with Louise Vivian (née Kidd) transferring the whole rear lot (102 acres) back to her mother Lydia in 1889.

While the only extant remnant of James Kidd's settlement of rear Lot 14, Concession 7 is the stone slot bank barn, the house located at 2187 Gordon Street was built by the Blair family. In the 1870s the Blair family, headed by Scottish immigrant James Blair, bought the farm located across the road at what is now 2162 Gordon Street on Lot 14 Concession 8. James Blair's son, William G. Blair, purchased the rear half of Lot 7 Concession 14 in 1906 and sold it to his 37-year-old brother John Blair in 1907 for $1.00 subject to mortgage. Thus, the Blair family had farms on both sides of Gordon Street. According to a Guelph Mercury article of August 23, 1957 John Blair built the concrete house at 2187 Gordon Street in 1907. John and his wife Mina Blair were known for their orchard and in particular John Blair's skill at grafting fruit trees.

Description of Subject Buildings

James Kidd barn

The James Kidd barn is located west of the Blair farmhouse within 2187 Gordon Street (Attachment-1, Figure 1). This large farm barn building has an L-plan and was designed as a bank barn - built into the slope south of the farm lane so that

the main floor is accessed from the upper grade on the north side and the stable area in the basement is accessed from the lower grade on the south and east sides. This type of combination barn design, with hayloft above and stables below, dates to medieval times in what is now the United Kingdom and would have been well-known to settler farmers coming to Ontario from England, Wales and Scotland.

The barn was built in two stages, the earlier building being a rare stone slot bank barn and a later heavy timber bank barn addition on the east side of the original stone barn.

The construction date for the James Kidd barn was suggested by Archaeological Services Inc (ASI) in their report to the Clair-Maltby Secondary Plan titled Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment: Existing Conditions (Dec 2016, revised June 2017) as circa 1850 for both the stone barn and its timber frame addition. However, the stone bank barn was more likely constructed sometime after James Kidd and his wife Lydia Kidd settled the land in 1830 and the arrival of Kidd's brother Samuel Kidd in 1834. Samuel Kidd was indicated as a mason in the 1842 Census of Puslinch Township and the same census indicated that by 1842 James Kidd possessed 16 cows and 5 hogs. Therefore, it is reasonable to suggest that the Kidd family would have had reason and the ability by 1842 to have built a traditional stone bank barn to protect the Kidd farm livestock.

Stone Slot Bank Barn

The stone slot bank barn was constructed with mixed fieldstone walls supporting a heavy timber internal framing that supports a gable roof. The stone barn was built as a true bank barn - across the slope of the land. The most distinguishing feature of the original Kidd barn is that it was built with slots in the fieldstone walls for ventilation. This type of large bank farm barn constructed in stone with ventilation slots is unique as it is now the only building of its kind within the City of Guelph. The slots provided much needed year-round ventilation against spontaneous combustion of the grain stored in the barn. Other extant examples of this type of barn construction are very rare in the Wellington County and Waterloo Region area. Two excellent examples of stone slot barns are located in Centre Wellington (on Wellington Road 7) and in the City of Cambridge (at the rare ECO Centre on Blair Road) (Attachment-1, Figures 61 and 62).

Attachment-1 presents photos taken by Stephen Robinson of Heritage Planning staff during site inspections on: July 27, 2023 (with Property Standards staff); June 17, 2019 (with owner Mattamy Homes) and on August 15, 2011 (with owner Barbara Zuccala). These photos show that the north wall consisted of a large, sliding barn door hanging from a timber top plate between two walls of mixed, uncoursed fieldstone rubble (limestone and granite). Flanking the large barn door was a ventilation slot in the centre of both stone walls. Between the left slot and the large door was a small door (hinged on the top) that allowed air flow to the stables below and gave access to a stair to the lower floor area. The corners of the original bank barn are constructed with large, roughly squared stones each alternating into the adjoined walls. The mortar of the flush joints between the stones of the walls is likely original being light grey/tan in colour with pieces of unslaked lime left from mixing by hand.

Timber Bank Barn Addition

The heavy timber bank barn addition was built with its roof ridge perpendicular to the roof of the stone barn. The addition is a variant bank barn as it was placed with its north gable wall into the slope of the land.

The heavy timber bank barn addition was constructed on mixed fieldstone walls that have roughly squared quoins at its three outside corners. The west wall of the addition utilizes the extant east gable wall of the earlier stone bank barn. The southwest corner the lower level of the addition has an overhang that shelters an inset entrance to the stable area.

A chevron has been cut into the upper portion of the barn board exterior of the north gable wall. At the midpoint of the slope near the soffit on the north and south gable walls are cutouts in the vertical barn boards that create the cruciform shape of what is known historically as a Florian cross. It was a common belief in 19th century farming and barn building practices for this form of cross to be present on buildings to guard against loss by fire. Replacement of barn boards has removed the fourth cross (on the left of the south gable wall).

The timber frame bank barn addition is more difficult to date. This eastern part of the barn could have been built during the Kidd family ownership as early as 1850 (as suggested by ASI) or by the Blair family as late as 1907 - a possibility that had been suggested by members of the Heritage Guelph committee. The research suggests that the imbrication pattern created by the pressed metal sheets cladding areas of the roof of the addition were manufactured locally in the early 20th century by the Galt Art Metal Company. The presence of these extant shingles is an important clue to the date of the barn's construction. Whether they were installed as replacement roof cladding to a 19th century addition or if they were the original cladding of an early 20th century addition made by the Blair family is yet to be confirmed.

A wood timber frame shed building is indicated in Attachment-1, Figure 3 to the north of the stone slot bank barn. This shed building has no heritage status and it is not listed on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties. In the opinion of staff, the shed building has no cultural heritage value or interest.

Blair Farmhouse

The Blair farmhouse at 2187 Gordon Street is located on the west side of Gordon Street on the north side of the laneway that leads west into the property toward the small shed and large barn.

Built by John Blair about 1907, the farmhouse is 2-storeys in height with an L-plan and a ridged hip roof. The roof is clad with metal sheets similar to modern barn roofing and there is a reduced chimney rising where the two roof ridges meet. The front door is located within an open porch on the southwest corner of the house. The open porch has a shed roof supported by a corbel at both walls and a single corner post on a concrete pedestal. All doors and window sashes have been replaced with modern units. A single-storey, gable roof tail is located at the rear with a side door facing the laneway.

The building form and style has been described in the heritage register as Edwardian residential and is typical of early 20th century rural residential designs. What is not typical or common about this house is its method of construction. The

exterior walls were constructed with poured-in-place concrete that was rendered (or covered) with a thin stucco finish scored to give the impression of large, cut stone blocks. The colour of the stucco in the scored "blocks" over the windows and doors and at the corners is lighter to mimic smooth-faced stone lintels and quoins.

The existing gable roof tail that is attached to the rear wall of the house has a modern board and batten exterior. The tail is accessed from the kitchen through an original 5-panel wooden door. The existing tail appears to have been built on an older, fieldstone foundation visible at grade around the perimeter of the tail. This part of the house was likely re-built to replace a previous tail that also had a gable roof as the portion of the rear wall of the house within the tail's interior has not been rendered and the formed concrete substructure is clearly visible.

As the same fieldstone foundation is seen around the perimeter and interior foundation walls of the main part of the house it is reasonable to suggest that the formed concrete house was either built on top of the fieldstone foundation(s) of a previous house (possibly the James Kidd family home or the Mary Wood family home) - or the builder opted to use traditional stone masonry for the basement walls rather than using the formed concrete both above and below grade. Further evidence supporting the suggestion that the basement and foundation were constructed with earlier materials and techniques is seen in the presence of large cedar log joists supporting the main floor. Similar floor framing but on a larger scale is seen in the logs supporting the main floor of the stone slot barn. The white lime tape pointing applied over the foundation mortar joints of the foundation exterior is also a traditional building method for foundation exteriors that predates the use of formed concrete. These suggestions can only remain as conjecture as the location of any previous dwelling(s) of the James Kidd family has not been confirmed.

Statement of Significance

The subject property is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act because it meets six of the prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, according to Ontario Regulation 9/06 as amended by Ontario Regulation 539/22. The heritage attributes of 2187 Gordon Street display: design or physical, historical or associative, and contextual value.

Design/Physical Value

The Kidd barn at 2187 Gordon Street meets Criterion 1 because it exhibits design or physical value as it is an early and rare example of a stone slot bank barn built by 1842. The stone slot bank barn was constructed using local fieldstone with slots in the walls. This building is now the only one of its kind within the City of Guelph.

The Blair farmhouse at 2187 Gordon Street meets Criterion 1 exhibiting design value or physical value because it is an early and rare example of a material or construction method in its use of formed concrete for wall construction in a rural residential building.

The Kidd barn at 2187 Gordon Street meets Criterion 2 because it exhibits design or physical value as it displays a high degree of craftsmanship that is rarely preserved. The constructors utilized local materials including fieldstone in the immediate vicinity and the implementation of slots was at that time practical and highly efficient in maintaining the structural integrity of the barn.

Historical/Associative Value

The Kidd barn at 2187 Gordon Street meets Criterion 4 because it exhibits hand historical or associative value as it is linked with the Kidd family who occupied the property from the mid to late 19th century. James Kidd settled in the Township of Puslinch in 1830 and contributed to the agricultural community at the time. Agriculture was integral to the local economy during this time and the Kidd and Blair families were active within Wellington County's agricultural trade.

The Blair farmhouse at 2187 Gordon Street meets Criterion 4 because it exhibits historical or associative value as it is connected to the Blair family, an early settler of the Puslinch area. The Blair family had farms on both sides of Gordon Street and emigrated from Scotland in the 1870s. The family was well known for their extensive orchards.

Contextual Value

The Kidd barn and Blair farmhouse meet Criterion 7 because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of the area. The Kidd Barn and Blair farmhouse support the agricultural landscape of the surrounding area. The property maintains and defines the surrounding use for agricultural use as it was over the past two centuries.

The Kidd barn at 2187 Gordon Street meets Criterion 8 because it is physically, visually and historically connected with the adjacent mid to late 19th century property at 2162 Gordon Street, identified as the Marcolongo Farm, a protected cultural heritage landscape. The Kidd Barn was built into the bank and retains its function in the specific location on the barn in the landscape. The property is associated with the Blair family and represents a rural agricultural grouping along Gordon Street.

The John Blair farmhouse at 2187 Gordon Street meets Criterion 8 exhibiting contextual value because it is historically linked to its surroundings. James Blair, a Scottish immigrant to Puslinch Township bought the farm located across the road from the Kidd farm in the 1870s. Blair's son William G. Blair, purchased the subject property in 1906 and his brother John Blair built the formed concrete house at 2187 Gordon Street in 1907. John and his wife Mina (Hunt) Blair lived in the farmhouse for more than fifty years.

The Kidd barn and Blair farmhouse at 2187 Gordon Street meet Criterion 9 because they are landmarks along Gordon Street as people move north further into city limits. 2187 Gordon Street has been visible along Gordon Street, formerly Brock Road, for decades. The position of the barn and farmhouse in comparison to Gordon Street provides a clear view of the property from the roadway.

Heritage Attributes

The following elements of the property at 2187 Gordon Street should be considered as heritage attributes in a designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act:

James Kidd Barn

Stone slot bank barn

- Three door openings on the south (lower) wall and the upper door in the south wall.

- Original form of the bank barn with an end gable roofline and single-storey north wall and 2-storey south wall.
- Location and orientation of the stone bank barn to maintain the building as being built across a slope.
- Exterior and interior of all extant stone walls of the slot bank barn.
- All original slot ventilation openings and window and door openings seen in exterior and interior of extant stone walls (west gable wall, east gable interior wall and the two-storey south wall).

Heavy timber bank barn addition

- Original form of the heavy timber bank barn addition with its gable roofline and single-storey north wall and 2-storey south wall.
- Location and orientation of the heavy timber bank barn addition to maintain the building as being built into the slope.
- Vertically oriented exterior wood board cladding
- Extant cutouts in vertical boards of the upper north and south gable walls that create the shape of a Florian cross.
- Original heavy timber framing members – including pole rafters, and hand-hewn posts and beams and original joinery.
- Tape pointed stone wall exterior of lower level.
- Imbrication pattern created by pressed metal sheets cladding the roof.

Blair Farmhouse

- Original 2-storey form of the house with a hip roof and L-plan.
- Exterior walls constructed of formed in place concrete covered with a render that is incised with a pattern that mimics ashlar stone.

It is intended that non-original features may be returned to the documented earlier designs or to their documented original without requiring City Council permission for an alteration to the design.

Recommendation

Staff and Heritage Guelph recommend that City Council give notice of intention to designate 2187 Gordon Street because it meets six of the prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, in accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06 (as amended by O Reg. 569/22) under the Ontario Heritage Act. Therefore, the property merits individual heritage designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Consultations

A historical background of the James Kidd barn and the Blair farmhouse as well as staff's recommended statement of significance and list of recommended heritage attributes were presented to Heritage Guelph at their meeting of September 11, 2023. The meeting agenda materials, correspondence received, video and minutes are available on the Heritage Guelph meeting calendar.

The research presented to Heritage Guelph has been incorporated into Attachment-2 of this report with necessary revisions made. Heritage Planning staff acknowledge and appreciate the contributions made to our understanding of this property by past and present members of Heritage Guelph. Heritage Guelph comments and correspondence submitted to the committee were considered by staff and addressed in this report, including correspondence from P.B. Skerrett and the

minutes from the September 11, 2023 Heritage Guelph meeting. Members asked whether the stone foundation of the concrete house could be included as a heritage attribute. Staff note that the suggestion that the stone foundation being a vestige of a previous house can only remain as conjecture as the location of any previous dwelling(s) of the James Kidd family has not been confirmed.

On September 11, 2023, Heritage Guelph passed the following motions:

> THAT the comments provided by Heritage Guelph members and correspondence provided by P. Brian Skerrett on the 2187 Gordon Street: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report be provided to staff and Council for their consideration.
>
> THAT Heritage Guelph supports the heritage attributes identified for 2187 Gordon Street as outlined in the staff report dated September 11, 2023; and
>
> THAT Heritage Guelph recommends that City Council give notice of its intention to designate 2187 Gordon Street pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Attachments

Attachment-1 Property Location and Photos Taken by Heritage Planning Staff

Attachment-2 Historic Images and Documents

Attachment-3 Ontario Regulation 9/06: Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

Departmental Approval

Melissa Aldunate, MCIP, RPP, Manager of Policy Planning

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, CAHP, Senior Heritage Planner

This report was approved by:

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP
General Manager, Planning and Building Services
Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
krista.walkey@guelph.ca
226 820 5615 x 2395

This report was recommended by:

Jayne Holmes, P. Eng., PMP
Deputy Chief Administrative Officer
Infrastructure, Development and Enterprise Services
519-822-1260 extension 2248
jayne.holmes@guelph.ca