# Information Report



Service Area Corporate Services

Date Friday, March 27, 2020

Subject Litigation Status Report

Report Number CS-2020-11

### **Executive Summary**

#### **Purpose of Report**

To provide information regarding the current status of litigation involving the City.

#### **Key Findings**

The amount of litigation, excluding planning and insured matters, that the City is involved in remained static, more or less, over the last six months. The number of matters, excluding insured matters, being handled by external counsel remained the same over the last six months.

#### Financial Implications

N/A

### Report

#### **Details**

The attached table sets out the details of the litigation the City is involved in and the resolutions that have occurred since the last report, which was issued in September 2019.

Legal Services continues to seek resolution of the litigation and LPAT matters in a timely fashion, and has been successful in resolving a number of matters in the last six months.

#### **Financial Implications**

N/A

#### Consultations

N/A

#### Strategic Plan Alignment

This report aligns with Strategic Plan priority Working together for our future; improving how the City communicates with residents and delivers services.

#### **Attachments**

Attachment-1: Litigation Status Report as of March 18, 2020

#### **Departmental Approval**

N/A

#### **Report Author**

Jeff Aitkens, Deputy City Solicitor

**Approved By** 

Christopher C. Cooper

General Manager Legal, Realty and Court Services/City Solicitor

Corporate Services

(519) 822-1260 extension 2288

christopher.cooper@guelph.ca

**Recommended By** 

Trevor Lee

Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

**Corporate Services** 

(519) 822-1260 extension 2281

trevor.lee@guelph.ca

	COURT ACTIONS				
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel	
Bousfield v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-20- 060)	Application seeking declaration for property to have legal non-conforming status	• February 7, 2020 – City served with Notice of Application	<ul> <li>March 31, 2020</li> <li>First</li> <li>Appearance in Motions Court</li> </ul>	Legal Services	
Fava v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 429)	Appeal of Property     Standards Committee     Decision	<ul> <li>November 22, 2019</li> <li>City served with Notice of Appeal</li> </ul>	<ul><li>June 22, 2020</li><li>Appeal to be heard</li></ul>	Legal Services	
Ahmad Nasef v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 068)	• Slip and Fall – March 2, 2017	<ul> <li>March 1, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim</li> <li>March 15, 2019 – City served and filed Defence</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Examinations for Discovery to be scheduled</li> </ul>	Legal Services	
Huish and Hayston v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 048)	Malicious Prosecution	<ul> <li>February 26, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim</li> <li>March 8, 2019 – City served and filed Notice of Intent to Defend</li> </ul>	Settlement     Discussions     Ongoing	Legal Services	
Stewart v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-18- 422)	Property Standards     Claim	<ul> <li>December 4, 2018 –</li> <li>City served with</li> <li>Statement of Claim</li> <li>January 4, 2019 -</li> <li>City served and filed</li> <li>Defence</li> </ul>	Examinations for Discovery to be scheduled	Legal Services	
City of Guelph v. Huish and Hayston (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV 18- 367)	Appeal decision of Property Standards Committee	October 11, 2018 –     City served Notice of     Application	Hearing date to be scheduled	Legal Services	
Marfisi v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 408/17 SR)	Bicycle Accident –     October 13, 2015	<ul> <li>October 5, 2017 –</li> <li>City served with</li> <li>Statement of Claim</li> <li>November 28, 2017 –</li> <li>City filed Defence</li> <li>and Crossclaim</li> </ul>	City to be indemnified by Co-Defendant	Legal Services	

	CO	URT ACTIONS		
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
Evering v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 227/17)	Slip and Fall - February 2013	<ul> <li>May 23, 2017 – City served with Statement of Claim</li> <li>June 29, 2017 – City filed Defence</li> <li>November 23, 2017 – City requested scheduling of Examinations</li> </ul>	• Examinations for Discovery to be scheduled	Legal Services
Evering v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 228/17)	Slip and Fall –     February 2017	<ul> <li>May 23, 2017 – City served with Statement of Claim</li> <li>June 29, 2017 – City filed Defence</li> <li>November 23, 2017 – City requested scheduling of Examinations</li> </ul>	Examinations for Discovery to be scheduled	Legal Services
Jakel v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 670/16)	• Slip and Fall	<ul> <li>November 2, 2016 –         City served with         Notice of Action and         Statement of Claim</li> <li>December 1, 2016 –         City filed Defence</li> <li>November 8, 2017 –         City requested         scheduling of         Examinations</li> </ul>	• Examinations for Discovery to be scheduled	Legal Services
Westminister Woods v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 707/13)	Claim re: Stage III     Services pursuant to     Subdivision Agreement	<ul> <li>October 4, 2013 – Statement of Claim served on City</li> <li>November 12, 2013 <ul> <li>City filed</li> <li>Statement of</li> <li>Defence</li> <li>November 25, 2013 <ul> <li>Reply served on</li> <li>City</li> </ul> </li> </ul></li></ul>	• Summary Judgment Motion Scheduled for March 30, 2020	Legal Services Aird & Berlis LLP

COURT ACTIONS RESOLVED SINCE September 18, 2019				
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
Martin v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior	Trip and Fall	<ul> <li>January 3, 2019 –</li> <li>City served with</li> <li>Statement of Claim</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Legal Services
Court of Justice		• February 24, 2020 – City received order		

	COURT ACTIONS RESOLVED SINCE September 18, 2019				
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel	
Court File No. CV-18-425 SR)		dismissing the action			
Runstedler v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 159/18 SR)	• Flood Damage	<ul> <li>April 13, 2018 – City served with Notice of Action</li> <li>May 25, 2018 – City served Defence</li> <li>October 11, 2019 – matter discontinued on consent</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Legal Services	
Smith v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 18/16)	<ul> <li>Claim for an order to remove and realign certain public utilities located under the plaintiffs' property at 16 Summerfield</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>January 14, 2016 – Statement of Claim served on City</li> <li>March 2, 2016 – City served Defence</li> <li>Settlement reached</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Legal Services Rodrigues Paiva LLP	

	LPA	T MATTERS		
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
75 Dublin Street North (Case No. PL180546)	<ul> <li>Appeal by Rykur         Holdings Inc. from the         refusal of a privately         initiated Official Plan         Amendment.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>May 22, 2018 – Appeal Received</li> <li>November 8, 2018 – Case management conference held</li> <li>February 12, 2020 – case management conference held</li> </ul>	No hearings scheduled at this time	Legal Services
132 Clair Road West (Case No. PL171454)	<ul> <li>Appeals by Herbert         Neumann, Frank         Cerniuk, Sieben         Holdings Limited, H         and J Produce Limited,         and McEnery Industries         Limited</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>December 4, 2017 – 2 appeals received</li> <li>June 10, 2019 – Pre-hearing held</li> <li>November 29, 2019 – Status hearing held</li> </ul>	April 2, 2020 –     Pre-hearing scheduled	Legal Services
75 Dublin Street North (Case No. PL161294)	Appeals by Upper Grand District School Board, Old Guelph Neighborhood Association Inc., and Rykur Holdings Inc.	<ul> <li>December 21, 2016 <ul><li>appeal received</li></ul> </li> <li>August 14, 2017 – <ul><li>pre- hearing held</li></ul> </li> <li>November 17, 2017 <ul><li>Motion hearing</li><li>held</li></ul> </li> <li>May 11, 2018 – <ul><li>Interim decision on</li><li>motions issued.</li></ul> </li> </ul>	No hearings scheduled at this time	Legal Services
OPA 48 (7 Appeals)	Seven (7) Appeals received relating to	December, 2013 –     OPA 48 Approved by  Page 2 of 11	• March 23, 2018 – decision	Legal Services

		AT MATTERS		
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
(Case No. PL 140042)	Official Plan Amendment 48 (Envision Guelph) as approved by the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.	Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing December, 2013 – Appeals received September 15, 2015 Phase 1 hearing scheduled for 10 days - adjourned November 20, 2015 Phase 1 decision issued resolving part of one (1) appeal September 25, 2017 Housekeeping phase hearing completed	issued confirming settlement of Niska Road Lands Phase • No further hearings scheduled at this time	
Road South (Case No. PL121406)	Appeals by Victoria     Park Village Ltd.     regarding failure to     make a decision within     the prescribed time	<ul> <li>November 29, 2012 <ul> <li>Appeal received</li> </ul> </li> <li>May 14, June 28, <ul> <li>September 18 and</li> <li>November 15, 2013</li> <li>Prehearings held</li> </ul> </li> <li>June 16, 2014 – <ul> <li>hearing held by</li> <li>teleconference</li> </ul> </li> <li>April 29 and August <ul> <li>18, 2015 – hearings</li> <li>held by</li> <li>teleconference</li> </ul> </li> <li>November 5, 2015 - <ul> <li>Status hearing held</li> </ul> </li> <li>May 3, 2016 – <ul> <li>hearing held by</li> <li>teleconference</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	No hearings scheduled at this time	Legal Services Garrod Pickfield

	LPAT MATTERS RESOLV	/ED SINCE September	18, 2019	
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
580 Paisley Road – Armel Corporation (Case No. MM080050)	<ul> <li>Appeal by the owner, Armel Corporation, of a decision not to approve a site plan application for a proposed gas bar, car wash and kiosk. The main issue relates to site access.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>October 1, 2008 –</li> <li>Appeal received</li> <li>March 9, 2020 –</li> <li>received order</li> <li>dismissing the</li> <li>appeal.</li> </ul>	This mater is complete	Legal Services
Development Charge By-law (2019) - 20372 (Case No. DC190005)	Appeal by Hugh     Whiteley	<ul> <li>March 25, 2019 – appeal received</li> <li>August 9, 2019 – pre-hearing held</li> <li>January 13-14, 2020 – hearing held</li> <li>February 18, 2020 – Decision received</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Garrod Pickfield LLP
58 Memorial Crescent (Case No. PL190309)	Appeal by Annamaria     Bartolomucci	<ul> <li>July 2, 2019 – appeal received</li> <li>November 6, 2019 – hearing held</li> <li>January 17, 2020 – Decision received</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Legal Services
622 College Avenue West (Case No. PL190325)	Appeal by Jaspreet and Gurkirat Dhillon	<ul> <li>July 16, 2019 – appeal received</li> <li>December 9, 2020 – Hearing held</li> <li>January 3, 2020 – Decision received</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Legal Services
89 Beechwood Avenue (Case No. PL190050)	Appeal by Tom Wood	<ul> <li>February 15, 2019 – appeal received August 8, 2019 – Case management conference held</li> <li>December 23, 2019 – Decision received</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Garrod Pickfield
435 Stone Road West (Cast No. MM190013)	Appeal by Stone Road Mall Holdings Inc.	<ul> <li>July 24, 2019 –</li> <li>appeal received</li> <li>November 28, 2019</li> <li>Appeal withdrawn</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Legal Services

144 Watson Road North (Case No. PL170803)	Appeal by CP REIT     Ontario Properties and     Loblaw Properties     Limited	<ul> <li>July 12, 2017 – Appeal received</li> <li>January 31, 2018 – hearing date adjourned</li> <li>October 7, 2019 – Order received</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	Legal Services
<b>15 Dumbarton</b> <b>Street</b> (Case No. PL190148)	<ul> <li>Appeal by Andrew Westbrook</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>March 29, 2019 – appeal received</li> <li>July 10, 2019 – Hearing held</li> <li>September 18, 2019 – Order received</li> </ul>	This matter is complete	City not a party

	<u>O</u> THE	ER MATTERS		
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
Kovarthanan Konesavarathan Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario (File No. 2017- 28841-I)	Appeal by K.     Konesavarathan	<ul> <li>November 30, 2018 <ul><li>HRTO sent</li><li>Application to</li><li>Respondents</li></ul></li> <li>July 5, 2017 – <ul><li>Application</li><li>submitted to HRTO</li></ul></li> <li>January 17, 2019 – <ul><li>City filed Response</li></ul></li> <li>October 18, 2019 – <ul><li>hearing held</li></ul></li> </ul>	March 24, 2020 – continuation of October 18, 2019 hearing scheduled	Legal Services
The Corporation of the City of Guelph v. Director, Ministry of the Environment (Case No. 13-013)	City is appealing to the Environmental Review Tribunal (ERT) the issuance of Permit to Take Water Number 5080-8TAKK2 to River Valley Developments Inc.	<ul> <li>February 12, 2013 <ul> <li>City filed an application for Leave to Appeal with the ERT</li> <li>May 2, 2014 – Leave to Appeal to ERT granted</li> <li>City filed Appeal</li> <li>November 4, 2014 - Status Update with ERT, held by teleconference.</li> <li>Third-party mediation session held November 28, 2014</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Mediation ongoing	Garrod Pickfield Legal Services

OTHER MATTERS RESOLVED SINCE September 18, 2019				
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
NONE	•	•	•	

M	MATTERS BEING HANDLED BY INSURERS' LEGAL COUNSEL *				
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel	
Blay v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-20- 102	Slip and Fall – April 17, 2018	March 13, 2020 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Counsel to be assigned		
McPhee v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-20- 31)	Automobile accident –     March 27, 2018	March 4, 2020 - City served with Statement of Claim	Counsel to be assigned		
Hung v. City of Guelph et al (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-20- 132)	Automobile accident –     February 2, 2019	January 21, 2020 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Counsel to be assigned		
Correia v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-20- 007)	Automobile accident –     January 13, 2018	<ul> <li>January 13, 2020 –</li> <li>City served with</li> <li>Statement of Claim</li> <li>February 18, 2020 –</li> <li>City Filed Statement</li> <li>of Defence</li> </ul>	• Examinations to be Scheduled	Insurer's legal counsel	
Harkness v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 382)	• Trip and Fall – July 2, 2018	October 16, 2019 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel	
Levesque v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 381)	• Slip and Fall – March 14, 2018	October 16, 2019 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel	
Hartung et al v. City of Guelph et al (Superior Court of Justice Court	Personal Injury –     September 30, 2016	July 8, 2019 –     Served with Motion     Record adding the     City as a Defendant	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel	

M	MATTERS BEING HANDLED BY INSURERS' LEGAL COUNSEL *					
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel		
File No. C-1341- 17)						
McIntosh v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 245)	Trip and Fall –     December 27, 2018	• June 27, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel		
Griffith v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 169)	• Trip and Fall – January 18, 2018	May 15, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel		
Azeb Kebede Birida v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 150)	• Personal Injury – January 22, 2018	April 30, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel		
1991333 Ontario Inc. v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 808	Alleged Negligent     Misrepresentation	April 23, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim	• Examinations to be scheduled	Insurer's legal counsel		
Madgy Eldakiky v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-18- 340)	Property Damage	• February 26, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel		
Victoria Mann v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 027)	• Slip and Fall – February 7, 2017	January 30, 2019 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Examinations to be scheduled	Insurer's legal counsel		
Starlight Group Property Holdings Inc.	Property Damage –     March 17, 2017	<ul> <li>January 28, 2019 – City served with Statement of Claim</li> </ul>	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel		

MATTERS BEING HANDLED BY INSURERS' LEGAL COUNSEL *					
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel	
et al. v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19- 026)					
Joshi v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-18- 457)	• Slip and Fall – April 20, 2018	January 21, 2019 –     City provided     Statement of Claim.	<ul><li>Examinations for Discovery Completed</li><li>City to Fulfil undertakings</li></ul>	Insurer's legal counsel	
Artymowicz v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-19-020)	Personal Injury – August 31, 2017	January 7, 2019 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Resolution     Discussions     Ongoing	Insurer's legal counsel	
Johnson v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-18- 448)	• Slip and Fall – January 18, 2017	<ul> <li>December 21, 2018</li> <li>City served with</li> <li>Statement of Claim</li> </ul>	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel	
Burns v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-18- 1303	Slip and Fall –     December 9, 2016	October 17, 2018 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel	
Smith v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-18- 304)	• Slip and Fall – February 7, 2017	August 28, 2018 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	City currently fulfilling undertakings	Insurer's legal counsel	
Brunet v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-18- 230)	Longboard accident –     September 13, 2016	• June 12, 2018 – City served with Statement of Claim	Resolution     Discussions     Ongoing	Insurer's legal counsel	
Simpson v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court	• Slip and Fall – February 14, 2018	May 8, 2018 – City served with Statement of Claim	<ul> <li>Examinations for Discovery held February 25, 2020</li> </ul>	Insurer's legal counsel	

М	AS OF MARCH 18, 2020  MATTERS BEING HANDLED BY INSURERS' LEGAL COUNSEL *					
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel		
File No. CV-18- 192)		-	Undertakings to be fulfilled			
Barry v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 144/18)	• Trip and Fall – November 14, 2016	April 5, 2018 – City served with Statement of Claim	Pre-Trial     Scheduled for     April 2020	Insurer's legal counsel		
Peacock v. City of Guelph (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 34/18)	• Slip and Fall – July 1, 2017	January 25, 2018 –     City served with     Statement of Claim	Insured's Legal counsel has been appointed	Insurer's legal counsel		
Cavanagh v. City of Guelph, Vinyl Jimmy Jazz, James Kritz and Jeffrey Bousfield (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 379/17)	• Slip and Fall – November 17, 2015	<ul> <li>September 19, 2017 <ul><li>City served with</li><li>Statement of Claim</li></ul></li> <li>December 15, 2018 <ul><li>Statement of</li><li>Defence filed by City</li></ul></li> </ul>	Co-Defendant has indemnified the City and assumed its defence	Insurer's legal counsel		
642762 Ontario Inc. v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 85/17)	Alleged environmental contamination	<ul> <li>August 23, 2017 –         City served with         Notice of Action and         Statement of Claim</li> <li>June 4, 2019 – City         filed Defence and         Crossclaim</li> </ul>	Examination for Discovery to be scheduled	Legal Services		
Sethupathi v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. CV-17-576347)	Motor vehicle accident     – January 12, 2016	• June 15, 2017 – City served with Statement of Claim	Examinations for Discovery have been scheduled	Insurer's legal counsel		
Livingston v. Guelph Transit et al. (Superior Court of Justice Court File No. 35/17)	• Transit incident – January 28, 2015	May 29, 2017 – City served with Statement of Claim	Pre-Trial     Schedule for     April, 2020	Insurer's legal counsel		
Cooper (Stewart) v. City of Guelph et al. (Superior	<ul> <li>Motor vehicle accident</li> <li>October 25, 2016</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>January 20, 2017 –</li> <li>Statement of Claim amended to include City as a party</li> </ul>	• Examinations for Discovery for Third Party	Insurer's legal counsel		

MATTERS BEING HANDLED BY INSURERS' LEGAL COUNSEL *				
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel
Court of Justice			Claim to be	
Court File No.			scheduled	
16-58756)				

<sup>\*</sup> Does not include claims solely against Guelph Police Services (i.e., City not named as a party)

INSURED MATTERS COMPLETE SINCE September 18, 2019					
Matter	Description	History	<b>Current Status</b>	Counsel	
NONE	•	•	•		