

Staff Report



To	City Council
Service Area	Infrastructure, Development and Environment
Date	Tuesday, July 9, 2024
Subject	12 Eramosa Road: Notice of Intention to Designate

Recommendation

1. That the City Clerk be authorized to publish and serve notice of intention to designate 12 Eramosa Road pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.
 2. That the designation bylaw be brought before Council for approval if no objections are received within the thirty (30) day objection period.
-

Executive Summary

Purpose of Report

The purpose of this report is to recommend that Council publish its intention to designate 12 Eramosa Road pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act. The cultural heritage significance and heritage attributes of the property are described in this report.

Key Findings

The corner building within the property addressed today as 12-16 Eramosa Road is listed as a non-designated built heritage resource on the City of Guelph's Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties under Section 27, Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

A property may be designated under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act if it meets at two or more of the criteria used to determine cultural heritage value or interest as set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06 (as amended by Ontario Regulation 569/22; see Attachment-4).

Heritage planning staff, in consultation with Heritage Guelph, have completed a [Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report](#) and [Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest](#). Staff have determined that the property meets five of the criteria used to determine cultural heritage value according to Ontario Regulation 9/06 (as amended by O. Reg 569/22) under the Ontario Heritage Act. Therefore, the property merits individual heritage designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Strategic Plan Alignment

The key findings and recommendations of this report align with 2024-2027 Strategic Plan priority 6.1.4 to conserve our cultural heritage resources.

Future Guelph Theme

City Building

Future Guelph Objectives

City Building: Grow and care for our community space and places

Financial Implications

None

Report

Location

The subject real property is located on the northwest corner of the intersection of Eramosa Road and Arthur Street North. The legal description of the subject of real property is PLAN 99 PT LOT 7 PT LOT 8. The real property includes the following addresses: 12, 14 and 16 Eramosa Road as well as 157 and 161 Arthur Street North. For the purposes of this report, the subject property will be referred to generally as 12 Eramosa Road.

Background

The subject property is part of Lots 7 and 8 of Plan 99. Plan 99, also known as Adam Fergusson's Survey, was registered in 1856. The land title abstract describes the ownership history of Lots 7 and 8 on the northeast side of Perth Street. Mitchell Street (to the north) and Perth Street (renamed Arthur Street in 1956) were named for John Mitchell and his previous home in Scotland. Mitchell was an early settler of Guelph Township and Guelph whose subdivided farmland become what is now the neighbourhood to the northwest of the subject property.

A building has stood on the northwest corner of Eramosa Road and Perth Street since at least 1862 as a building footprint is seen on Cooper's 1862 Map of the Town of Guelph, the 1872 Bird's Eye View of Guelph and Cooper's 1875 Map of Guelph. It is not known if that building was used as a corner store.

The land title abstract indicates David Brown purchased Lots 7 and 8 of Plan 99 in 1871. Brown's plans were to replace the existing building as reported in November 1874 Guelph Evening Mercury in its annual summary of building operations: "On the corner of the Eramosa Road and Perth Street, Mr. David Brown has erected a rough-cast store and dwelling. The size of the building is 60x40, with a Mansard roof and containing, besides the store, twelve rooms, and costing \$1,600."

Brown's new building was addressed as 38 and 40 Eramosa Road, and according to the Hacking Directory of 1873 David Brown ran the "groceries and provisions" store and resided on the property.

The 1881 (1892) Fire Insurance Plan shows the 1.5-storey store building as clad in rough-cast stucco with a single address of 40 Eramosa Road. The building had an irregular shape as it followed the angle of the street intersection. The northwest side of the building was a single storey with an attached shed. A detached shed stood to the north of the building. Also shown on the fire plan is a stone dwelling at 48 Eramosa Road. In 1875 the Guelph Evening Mercury had reported the following:

"D. Brown, stone cottage, 30 by 36. Contractors—Winton & Griffiths, stonework; Shand & Carver, carpenters; Day, plasterer; Pass, painter; Mills, tinsmith. Cost \$1200."

The building included 38 and 40 Eramosa Road. According to the directory 38 Eramosa Road was listed as "groceries and provisions", and 40 Eramosa Road was listed as the residence.

In the 1873 Hacking Directory, David Brown is listed as running the grocery store and residing on the property. Though David Brown still owned the property in 1882, Mrs. M. Hyde is listed as the proprietor of the grocery and a resident of the property. By 1882, though David Brown still owned the property, Mrs. M. Hyde both ran the grocery and resided on the property. Robert Dowrie is listed as running the grocery store and living in the attached home in 1885. In the 1894-1996 directory, Alex Cutting is listed as running the grocery on the Eramosa property and living on Perth Street.

The land title abstract shows that in November 1890 David Brown's will transferred ownership of the property to his 12-year old daughter Maggie M. Brown. In 1899 Brown's widow Ellen Brown took a mortgage of \$13,000 which was likely for the construction of the subject buildings. In 1910, after Ellen Brown's death, the executors transferred ownership of the property to Margaret M. Harbour (Maggie Brown). By 1916 Margaret Harbour and her husband Charles Harbour sold the property to Elizabeth Calloway.

The 1897 Fire Insurance Plan (revised in 1907 and 1911) show the two subject buildings: a 2-storey, brick store building addressed as 3 Perth Street and a 2-storey, brick stable at 7 Perth Street. The store building is indicated with its original footprint with a single-story, brick wing and a wood frame porch and shed to the north.

The 1922 Fire Insurance Plan (revised in 1929) shows that between 1922 and 1929 a 2-storey addition was made on the north side of the store building providing two additional shops addressed as 14 and 16 Eramosa Road. Additionally, it was at this time that the stable at 7 Perth Street was converted to a dwelling. The only changes indicated on the 1946 Fire Insurance Plan have to do with addresses: the former stable is listed as 5 Perth Street and the store building as 12, 14 and 16 Eramosa Road and 3 Perth Street. The 1960 Fire Insurance Plan presents the man door facing Arthur Street as 157 Arthur Street North and the former stable as 161 Arthur Street North.

Building Description

The corner store built in 1899 is a 2-storey building constructed in pressed red brick laid in a stretcher bond. The roof is hidden by a brick parapet with a rock-faced limestone coping that creates an elaborate roofline. The parapet has corbelled brick eave stops at the west and north corners of the building. The coping is connected by two protruding red brick pilasters dropping down to a rock-faced stone belt course that extends around the entire street-facing exterior.

The corner entrance has a half-glass door under a frosted, rectangular transom window. The date "1899" is carved into a large date stone set into the brick parapet above the massive stone lintel of the second floor window above the corner entrance. Both large storefront windows are framed by a large, wooden entablature resting on brick pilasters with rock-faced limestone capitals. The right

side of the Eramosa Road store window appears to have been filled in with brick. Over both storefront windows are paired windows with coursed brick, semi-circular arches and rock-faced limestone sills. The store window sills are rowlock brick.

The single door facing Arthur Street North is within an unusually tall opening and has a two-pane transom below a coursed brick skewback arch head with the appearance of a protruding keystone constructed in brick.

The 2-storey addition built between 1922 and 1929 has a thinner coping above two band courses of corbelled red brick with a pattern of headers and stretchers between. The windows of the addition have stone lintels and sills. Three entrance doors are inset in the middle of the ground floor flanked by large store windows.

The detached, 2-storey, red brick stable building has been painted black in a recent renovation. The building fronts onto Arthur Street North creating a triangular courtyard space between it and the corner building. The building form is rectangular in plan with a low-pitch gable roof and a brick parapet over the façade. The parapet has rock-faced limestone coping stones and is articulated with corbelled brick band courses, pilasters and eave stops. The outline of the large carriage door from the original use of the building as a stable has been bricked in on the elevation facing the triangular courtyard and an original man door bricked in to create the current ground floor window on the ground floor beside it. The upper window within the corbelled brick parapet appears to have a solid sill and was likely the access door to the stable's hayloft. The Arthur Street front door and all other windows (which have rowlock brick sills) were likely created in the conversion of use from stable to dwelling in the mid-1920s.

Other examples of corner stores in Guelph's residential neighbourhoods that are listed on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties include: 220 Gordon St; 217/219 Gordon St; 110 Norwich St E; 294 Woolwich St (now Park Grocery); 295 Woolwich St (now With the Grain); 194 Waterloo Ave; 440 York Rd.

Statement of Significance

The subject property is worthy of designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act because it meets six of the nine prescribed criteria for determining cultural heritage value or interest, according to Ontario Regulation 9/06 as amended by 569/22. The heritage attributes of 12 Eramosa Road Street display: design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual value.

Design/Physical Value

The subject property meets Criterion 1 because its two original buildings exhibit design or physical value are representative of Romanesque Revival architectural style from the end of the 19th century in a commercial/residential building design.

The subject property meets Criterion 2 because both buildings have high physical integrity in that they have retained most of their original architectural design features in red brick and limestone displaying a high degree of craftsmanship.

Historical/Associative Value

The subject property meets Criterion 4 because it has direct associations with a theme of historical mixed use involving local corner stores with housing above – a combination that was conventional in many of Guelph's residential neighbourhoods

since the establishment of the Town and in some cases continuing into the first half of the 20th century.

Contextual Value

The subject property meets Criteria 7 because it is important in defining, maintaining and supporting the architectural character of the area. These segments of the Eramosa Road and Arthur Street North streetscapes are important elements of the Arthur Street North candidate cultural heritage landscape identified by the City of Guelph's Cultural Heritage Action Plan.

The subject property meets Criteria 8 because its two buildings maintain their original configuration and are functionally, visually and historically linked. The 1920s addition to the north expanded the commercial/residential uses and its architectural design (although simplified) is quite compatible with the original building. The close proximity of the corner store doors and windows to the street gives it visual prominence at the intersection of these historic streetscapes.

The subject property meets Criteria 9 because the building's distinctive form and elaborate red brick and limestone construction has become a landmark within the historic Eramosa hill streetscape.

Heritage Attributes

The following elements of the property at 12 Eramosa Road should be considered as heritage attributes in a designation under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act:

- 2-storey, corner building form with elaborate roofline created by red brick parapet, corbelled brick corners and limestone coping
- original red brick exterior walls, pilasters and limestone belt courses facing Eramosa Road and Arthur Street North
- carved limestone in parapet above front corner door and upper level window
- original window and door openings with coursed brick semi-circular, segmental and flat arch heads and rock-faced limestone sills
- half-glass front corner entrance door below a large transom window
- two large storefront windows below a large, wooden entablature resting on brick pilasters with rock-faced limestone capitals
- single door facing Arthur Street North with two-pane transom below a coursed brick skewback arch head with the appearance of a protruding keystone constructed in brick
- 2-storey north addition with red brick exterior and stone coping above band courses of corbelled brick over two large storefront windows
- 2-storey, low pitch gable roof, stable building with a corbelled brick parapet and stone coping over the façade
- triangular courtyard space between the corner building and the stable building

It is intended that non-original features may be returned to the documented earlier designs or to their documented original without requiring City Council to amend the designation by-law.

Financial Implications

None

Consultations and Engagement

On September 11, 2023, Heritage Guelph [passed the following motion](#):

THAT the comments provided by Heritage Guelph members on the '12 Eramosa Road: Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report' be provided to staff and Council for their consideration.

On November 13, 2023, Heritage Guelph [passed the following motion](#):

THAT Heritage Guelph supports the heritage attributes identified for 12 Eramosa Road as outlined in the staff report dated November 13, 2023; and

THAT Heritage Guelph recommends that City Council give notice of its intention to designate 12 Eramosa Road pursuant to Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Heritage Planning reached out to the property owner via a letter dated October 24, 2023 to make them aware of staff's cultural heritage evaluation, statement of significance and recommended heritage attributes for 12 Eramosa Road before being brought to a Heritage Guelph meeting in November 2023. Heritage Planning staff have been in contact with the owner in June 2024 to make them aware of staff's recommendation to Council regarding an intention to designate the property.

Attachments

Attachment-1 Property Location

Attachment-2 Current Photos

Attachment-3 Historical Images and Documents

Attachment-4 Ontario Regulation 9-06 Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

Departmental Approval

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP, General Manager, Planning and Building Services

Report Author

Stephen Robinson, MA, CAHP, Senior Heritage Planner

This report was approved by:

Krista Walkey, MCIP, RPP

General Manager, Planning and Building Services

Infrastructure, Development and Environment

519-822-1260 extension 2395

krista.walkey@guelph.ca

This report was recommended by:

Terry Gayman, P. Eng.

Acting Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

Infrastructure, Development and Environment

519-822-1260 extension 2369

terry.gayman@guelph.ca